

## **Dissertation**

*Eva Tempesta (1162594)*

*The challenge of cooperation against human trafficking. A comparison  
between Italy and the Netherlands*

*27<sup>th</sup> August 2012*

*19913*

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Juergen Nowak



MACESS Maastricht

P.O. Box 634

6200 AP Maastricht

The Netherlands

Website: [www.macess.nl](http://www.macess.nl)

## Formal requirements

- The date of submission of the dissertation is **27 August 2012** (as per postmark) at the MA CESS Secretary by 17:00 hrs in the form of 4 paper copies plus a word document (.doc) copy on disc. Only 1 paper copy must bear the original signature of the student.
- The dissertation report begins with the two standard, formal MA CESS cover pages: the MA CESS title page followed by the page listing the formal requirements and assessment criteria; the statement of originality, date and signature of the student.
- The length of the dissertation is 15,000 - 20,000 words (containing the introduction, the main chapters, the conclusions, recommendations and footnotes). A student not meeting this requirement incurs an automatic failure.
- The text is word-processed using a computer on A4 paper with a 12pt character size. The format is double spaced, using page numbers and adequate margins such as those defined by the defaults of major word-processing programmes.
- The length of the English abstract is 500 words (maximum).
- The table of contents has numbered chapter titles, sections and corresponding page numbers.
- The Harvard system of referencing is the recommended style for citing in the body of the text and for listing bibliographical references.
- The end-product is soft bound with a thin cover.

## Assessment criteria

- clarity and viability of research question (and hypothesis, if applicable)
- critical analysis of theory and literature;
- clearly articulated and justified methodology and ethical considerations;
- quality of comparative framework and analysis;
- quality of conclusions and recommendations;
- rationale, cohesiveness and logical consistency;
- relevance for social professional practice and/or social policy;
- relevance for comparison at European and/or global levels;
- total presentation: linguistic style, lay-out, proper use of language.

This dissertation is the original work of Eva Tempesta (1162594) and has been completed solely in fulfilment of a dissertation for the MA in Comparative European Social Studies at Zuyd University in Maastricht.

This dissertation complies with the aforementioned formal requirements and recognises the assessment criteria.

.....

Student signature

.....

Place and date



***I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings***

*A free bird leaps on the back  
Of the wind and floats downstream  
Till the current ends and dips his wing  
In the orange sun rays  
And dares to claim the sky.*

*But a bird that stalks down his narrow cage  
Can seldom see through his bars of rage  
His wings are clipped and his feet are tied  
So he opens his throat to sing.*

*The caged bird sings with a fearful trill  
Of things unknown but longed for still  
And his tune is heard on the distant hill for  
The caged bird sings of freedom.*

*The free bird thinks of another breeze  
And the trade winds soft through  
The sighing trees  
And the fat worms waiting on a dawn-bright  
Lawn and he names the sky his own.*

*But a caged bird stands on the grave of dreams  
His shadow shouts on a nightmare scream  
His wings are clipped and his feet are tied  
So he opens his throat to sing.*

*The caged bird sings with  
A fearful trill of things unknown  
But longed for still and his  
Tune is heard on the distant hill  
For the caged bird sings of freedom.*

*Maya Angelou*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

*I Know Why the Caged Bird Sings* ..... 4

**List of Abbreviations** ..... 9

**List of Definitions** ..... 11

**ABSTRACT** ..... 14

**INTRODUCTION** ..... 16

**1. PART ONE RESEARCH PORPUSE**..... 19

    1.1. Human trafficking ..... 19

        1.1.2. Definition ..... 22

        1.1.3. Dimensions of Human Trafficking ..... 26

        1.1.4. Who can be identified as a potential victim ..... 27

        1.1.5. What corresponds to a trafficker’s profile..... 27

    1.2. Main research question ..... 29

    1.3. Objectives of the research..... 29

    1.4. Personal motivation ..... 30

**2. PART TWO COOPERATION BETWEEN LAW ENFORCEMENT AND SERVICE PROVIDERS**..... 32

    2.1. Law enforcement and Service providers ..... 32

        2.1.1. Law enforcement..... 32

        2.1.2. Service providers..... 32

        2.1.3. A relationship of interdependency ..... 33

2.2. Cooperation in accordance to the Palermo Protocol.....	34
2.3. The importance of cooperation .....	36
2.4. The Memorandum of Understanding.....	40
2.4.1. Benefits and potential risks of a MoU.....	41
2.5. Good practice concerning cooperation: the German case.....	43
2.5.1. Weak points of the German Model .....	45
2.6. Good practice concerning victim´s protection system: the Italian case.....	46
2.7. How to lead cooperation to improvement.....	47
<b>3. PART THREE METHODS .....</b>	<b>48</b>
3.1. The Dutch case.....	48
3.1.1. Prevention.....	50
3.1.2. The B9 Regulations .....	51
3.1.3. Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel .....	52
3.2. The Italian Case .....	53
3.2.1. Prevention.....	53
3.2.2. Law.....	54
3.2.3. Article 13 and Article 18 .....	54
3.3. Research Design .....	58
3.3.1. Methods of data collection .....	59
3.3.2. Interviews in Italy.....	62
3.3.3. Interviews in the Netherlands.....	63

3.4. Ethical considerations .....	64
<b>4. PART FOUR ANALYSES.....</b>	<b>66</b>
4.1. Analysis of the interviews in the Netherlands .....	67
4.1.1. Dutch informants' profile.....	67
4.1.2. Police officers.....	67
4.1.3. Caroline Loeber.....	67
4.1.4. Reymond Venema.....	68
4.1.5. Social Service providers.....	68
4.1.6. Murielle Payet .....	69
4.1.7. Lianne Belt .....	69
4.1.8. Professional's approach to cooperation.....	70
4.1.9. Organization of the established cooperation .....	72
4.1.10. Weaknesses and contrasts .....	73
4.2. Analysis of the interviews in Italy .....	75
4.2.1. Italian informants' profile .....	75
4.2.2. Social Service providers.....	75
4.2.3. Claudio Donadel.....	75
4.2.4. Giuseppina Di Bari.....	77
4.2.5. Police office.....	77
4.2.6. Gianfranco Guarnieri.....	77
4.2.7. Professional's approach to cooperation.....	78

4.2.8. Organization of the established cooperation .....	80
4.2.9. Weaknesses and contrasts .....	82
4.3. Comparative analysis between the two countries .....	83
4.3.1. Commons .....	83
4.3.2. Differences .....	84
4.3.3. Conclusion.....	85
4.4. Recommendations.....	87
<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>89</b>



## List of Abbreviations

<b>ANCI</b>	Associazione Nazionale Comuni Italiani (National Association of Italian Municipalities)
<b>BMFSFJ</b>	Bundesministerium für Familie, Senioren, Frauen und Jugend (Federal German Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth)
<b>BNRM</b>	Bureau Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel (Dutch Human Trafficking's National Rapporteur)
<b>COMENSHA</b>	Coördinatiecentrum Mensenhandel (Coordination Center of Human Trafficking)
<b>COE</b>	Council of Europe
<b>DNR</b>	Dienst Nationale Recherche (National Research Department)
<b>FIET</b>	Flexible Informatie en Expertise Team (Flexibel Intelligence and Expertise Team)
<b>FRA</b>	European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights
<b>IACP</b>	International Association of Chiefs of Police
<b>ILO</b>	International Labour Organization
<b>IND</b>	Immigratie en Naturalisatiedienst (Dutch Immigration and Naturalization Service)

<b>KOK</b>	Bundesweiter Koordinierungskreis gegen Frauenhandel und Gewalt an Frauen im Migrationsprozess e.V. (German nationwide activist coordination group combating trafficking in women and violence against women in the process of migration)
<b>MOU</b>	Memorandum of Understanding
<b>NGOs</b>	Non Governmental Organizations
<b>NRM</b>	Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel (Dutch Human Trafficking's National Rapporteur)
<b>OIM</b>	Organization of International Migration
<b>OSCE</b>	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
<b>SHOP</b>	Stichting Hulpverlening Opvang Prostituees (Foundation for social aid and Shelters for Prostitutes)
<b>STV</b>	Stichting Tegen Vrouwenhandel (Dutch Foundation Against Human Trafficking)
<b>UN</b>	United Nations
<b>UN.GIFT</b>	United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking
<b>UNODC</b>	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

<b>List of Definitions</b>		
<b>ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (1999)</b>	<b>Pg. 35</b>	Convention concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor.
<b>Joint ECCAS/ECOWAS Plan of Action against Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children in West and Central Africa (2006)</b>	<b>Pg. 35</b>	Bi-regional plan of action to reaffirm the ECOWAS Initial Plan of Action against Trafficking in Persons (2002-2003) and extend efforts to combat trafficking into the Central African region.
<b>MOU</b>	<b>Pg. 40</b>	Memorandum of Understanding. It represents a formal cooperation agreement between all actors involved, especially law enforcement agencies and specialized service providers. It contributes adopting an effective strategy in order to prevent trafficking in human beings but also the right basis for investigating and prosecuting traffickers. Through these cooperation agreements it tries to ensure the safety and

		protection of victim's rights (UN. GIFT & IOM, 2009).
<b>Federal Working Group on Trafficking in Women and Violence against women in the migration process</b>	<b>Pg. 43</b>	Under the leadership of the German Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens the Women and Youth. The Federation-State Working Group on Trafficking in Women is composed by different stakeholder: Specialized non-governmental organizations (Counseling services) and different Ministries at Federation and State level (BMFSFJ, 2007).
<b>Osservatorio sul fenomeno della Tratta degli esseri Umani</b>	<b>Pg. 53</b>	Human Trafficking Observatory.
<b>Misure contro la tratta di persone</b>	<b>Pg. 54</b>	Measures against trafficking in human beings.
<b>Questura</b>	<b>Pg. 77</b>	Police Office.
<b>Sostituto Commissario</b>	<b>Pg. 77</b>	Deputy Commissionair

<b>Questore of Venice</b>	<b>Pg. 62</b>	Quaestor, Head of the Police office in Venice
<b>Korpsmonitor</b>	<b>Pg. 73</b>	Monitoring entity for prostitution and trafficking in human beings.
<b>Fairwork</b>	<b>Pg. 73</b>	Organization which provides training courses, workshops, presentation and education about human trafficking.
<b>Servizio Adulti dell'Assessorato alle Politiche Sociali</b>	<b>Pg. 77</b>	Adults' Service of the Council Office for Social Policies
<b>Seconda Sezione della Squadra mobile</b>	<b>Pg. 78</b>	Second Section of the Flying Squad.

## **ABSTRACT**

This particular research will be about what today is referred as modern slavery: trafficking of human beings. Human trafficking together with drugs and guns trade represents the biggest world wide current crime. Even though, the exact figures about the number of people involved is still difficult to define in accordance to the underground nature of the phenomenon (IACP, 2006). Because of the broad field of study and the many factors involved this particular research will try to narrow down and focus on a specific angle. The high lighted aspect will be represented by cooperation dynamics between law enforcement and social service providers tackling human trafficking cases through a comprehensive approach. Law enforcement and social service providers play both a key role in the assistance process once victims' decide to leave the exploitation system and start a new life. Social services providers play an important role in helping victims reconstructing their new lives. Because of the complex target group, service providers have to consider several levels of trauma victims' have to elaborate during the assistance phases. The several levels consist of different elements which include psychological, physical and cultural aspects. In general is very difficult to address their needs in a totally proper way. In parallel law enforcement aim to combat the crime, convict exploiters and bring justice while protecting the rights and well-being of trafficked persons. As a consequence both professional's work is strongly linked because they depend on each other and need to compensate each other's work in order to provide a complete overall respond. In order to achieve this, building operational and institutional links between specialized service providers and law enforcement, but also other stakeholders, is strongly recommended and in many

countries already takes place. This research will include a comparison between two European countries the Netherlands and Italy and will dedicate a chapter to a good practice model, as an example, provided by Germany. Italy and the Netherlands were chosen to be analyzed due to their high level of involvement in to the phenomenon. The Netherlands as country of origin, transit and destination involves trafficking of men women and children trafficked for forced prostitution and forced labor. The origin countries of victims are different including also Dutch girls. On the other hand Italy is only a destination and transit country for women, children, and men subjected to sex trafficking and forced labor (Department of States, 2012). The whole research is based on an accurate literature review together with an empirical part developed through qualitative methods. Professionals in the Netherlands and in Italy were interviewed and on the basis of their professional experience they answered formulated questions. This research intends to demonstrate practical aspects that on the basis of theoretical former research show the effectiveness of adopting a comprehensive, multilevel and victim's human rights approach. Until now a lot has been done, but still a lack of funding slows the development of new innovative measures and can create an obstacle in the achievement of pre established goals even though interventions, based on a comprehensive approach demonstrate accountability, results and a beneficial impact.

## **INTRODUCTION**

Human trafficking is a serious crime that involves million of victims around the world. The phenomenon is characterized by a process where people are recruited in their own societies and countries and transferred to a destination country where they will be exploited and treated as slaves (UN. GIFT, 2008). Several are the reasons, however mainly it can be attributed to political and socio-economic developments of origin countries but also to the increasing request of cheap labours in western countries (van Duyne & Spencer, 2011). The ways how potential victims are recruited, transferred and exploited is expressed in several forms. The variety and unclear dynamics contribute in making the phenomenon more complicated and variable in time; reason why it is implicitly requested to research it constantly (Orfano & D'Angelo, 2005). Since the beginning, exploitation of people has involved different countries. Every country has a different way to approach the phenomenon. However, the overall aim of initiatives adopted by different governments is similar and focuses on: preventing trafficking in human beings, protecting and assisting victims and bring criminals to justice (UN.GIFT, 2008). Constant cross national research and a proper platform where to share information between countries and different stakeholders is still strongly recommended in order to develop a unique way of tackling the phenomenon on an international level. Reports from the European Anti-trafficking days explain that the actions need to be planned and the 3P's principles should be taken into consideration: Prevention Prosecution and Protection to combat trafficking in human beings (Council of European Union, 2009). In this particular research these three principles would be explored and one more "P" would be add and considered as fundamental for the development of this



work: Partnership (Schlaeger, 2010). In fact, the overall aim of this study is trying to answer the following question: What barriers or challenges do local law enforcement and victim's service providers face collaborating in responding to a trafficking case?

Cooperation between law enforcement and social service providers is intended as a measure to prevent and combat trafficking in human beings. This particular research will try to underline the importance of a comprehensive approach focusing on law enforcement and social service providers who should strongly cooperate in order to develop synergistic strategies. Even though the need of a holistic approach should require cooperation, not only between law enforcement and social service providers but involve more stakeholders in order to obtain a multilevel cooperation, to achieve a "human rights based" approach which do not exclude criminal law, it just emphasizes the vulnerable position of the victim and underlines the importance of including assisting and protective measures as first (Rijken & Koster, 2008). The need of a holistic approach is expressed also by the most important convention signed by different countries involved in human trafficking as origin, transit and destination countries: the UN Trafficking Protocol with the aim to prevent the phenomenon, protect victims and prosecute criminals. Also, supported by the Council of Europe's Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings where is mentioned that the respect and protection of victim's rights has to be achieved in a comprehensive manner (Ministry of Justice Sweden & IOM, 2010). In order to show how it works practically and understand if the principles behind the conventions are adopted by European governments this research will compare and analyze two European countries: Italy and the Netherlands. Both countries are involved as transit and destination countries; even though they are approaching the issue differently there are some similarities due to certain practices and

principles agreed all over Europe. In order to introduce the reader to human trafficking, the entire first chapter will provide a description of the phenomenon. It will define human trafficking; give a general overview about dimensions of the phenomenon and describe the aim of this research. Afterwards, in chapter two, the importance of cooperation will be explained and the German case as an example of good practice will be reported but also appropriate incentive tools like Memorandum of Understandings will be described. Due to this chapter the reader will have a better understanding about the central focus of the research and how cooperation should be or is perceived at a European level according to the conventions signed by different countries. Moreover, in part three, Italy and the Netherlands will be described. An accurate description on how the countries are affected and how they tackle the issue will be given together with the methods used to develop the empirical part of this research. While the last part, will describe the findings and analyze the interviews conducted in both countries and conclude with recommendations emerged as a result of the development of this research.

# **1. PART ONE RESEARCH PORPUSE**

## **1.1. Human trafficking**

Human Trafficking is a global and multifaceted phenomenon. It is an important international trade involving different actors and different countries. It has been identified as being the fastest- growing international crime industry in the world (Ngozi Ezeilo, 2009). In Europe, trafficking of human beings, especially with the aim of sexual exploitation, started being more visible and important at the beginning of the 90s. The immigration flows to Europe from eastern European countries, but also non-European countries, have been growing during the last years. The reasons are different they can be related to the unstable political situation and the economic crises of certain countries, lack of future perspectives and more in general the increasing gap between north and south of the world (Scarpa, 2008). However, the principle causes of human trafficking, as many researchers describe, are characterized by “pull” and “push” factors, which interlink between each other. The “pull” factors are in fact represented by the demand in destination countries of different services provided by trafficked victims for example sexual services or inexpensive labor force but also by the general attractiveness of western countries’ welfare, cultural models and life styles. On the other hand, we have “push” factors delineated by poverty, lack of education, lack of employment opportunities, inadequate social programs, inequality between genders, lack of information for potential migrants about safe migration opportunities and the dangers of trafficking, but also, more widely speaking, the phenomenon of globalization of labor and markets. Normally, these are the one which represent the main causes why people are trafficked, or wish to realize an immigration project while hoping in a better future

(Baldoni, 2007). The current situation, characterized by an increasing number of immigration flows, has developed a stricter and more severe approach from western countries towards immigration policies and access to European destination countries. As a consequence the demand from migrants to organized criminal groups, to access western countries, has increased and has facilitated the recruitment of potential victims of human trafficking. (UN.GIFT, n.b.). The whole process of trafficking persons, as it will be clarified more precisely in the definition sub-paragraph, includes certain steps which refer to the act of recruiting, transporting, transferring, harboring or receiving a person by threatening or using force or other forms of coercion, for the purpose of exploitation. The person is trafficked if she or he is forced or tricked into a situation where he or she is exploited (UNODC & UN.GIFT, 2010). The main purpose of the whole trafficking process is represented by exploitation of people in destination countries. Exploitation may develop in different forms and degrees. The exploitation and the circumstances under which this often occurs are reasons why trafficking in human beings is currently frequently called modern-day slavery. As a common consequence, victims are treated as an object, it involves forced labor, where there is no decision power over the income, and where victims risk also to be sold different times (UNODC, 2012). However, the recruiting process of victims is not related to a single and standardized model but it is determined by several factors. Victims sometimes know personally the recruiter, who can also be a family member. While, other times she or he does not know this person who is cheating him or her by promising a job and a better life abroad. Nonetheless, most of the cases they do not expect to be exploited in destination countries, their future exploiters deceive them with the promise of working as a waitress, domestic worker, in a bar or as a babysitter. Some researches, report that

sometimes victims are aware about their future job in destination countries (for example working in the sex industry) but they totally ignore the slavery working conditions. The traffickers frequently loan money to people in order to cover travel expenses. The repayment of these transportation fees convicts the victim to debt bondage. The loaner adds interest to the loan to gain control over the person, who may remain in the condition of bonded labor for many years or her/his entire life. Many victims forced in sex industry and in labor exploitation find themselves, often, in these kind of situations (Scarpa, 2008). In Europe, a typical example is represented by Nigerian women trafficked to Italy or to the Netherlands for sexual exploitation. The exploitation model is based on debt bondage where victims have to repay a debt that raises dramatically through a mechanism of fines and penalties. This is only one example, there are many cases spread all over the world where the practice of debt bondage is normally used by traffickers (Carchedi, Bernadotti, & Ferone, 2005). The trafficking phenomenon impersonates a cruel violation of victim's human rights during the whole exploitation period, which may last for years. It is a cross national crime, where sometimes the distances between origin and destination countries are quite extend, even if certain countries present an important domestic human trafficking (UNODC, 2012). Human trafficking appears as a difficult phenomenon to quantify as there is hardly any official data, due to the underground nature of the problem. The exact number of victims is not possible to be identified, and vary greatly depending on the cited source. The available data are represented by indicative figures which can give a general overview about the issue but do not attest the real situation. The submerged, for example, of the phenomenon is impossible to state (Baldoni, 2007). It is also necessary to mention that many countries in the world have just recently introduced anti-trafficking legislation,

and also the unwillingness of victims to denounce their traffickers for fear of repercussions on them and their relatives do not contribute in the collection of reliable data. The increasing anti- trafficking programs around the world have encouraged the collection of data from States or Ngos, but it is still very difficult to compare them due to the fact that there is no common mechanism used to collect them. And also, the main researches focus more on sexual exploitation of victims forced into prostitution than other forms of exploitation (Scarpa, 2008). In order to give an indicative overview we will report some figures collected by UN. GIFT. According to UN. GIFT the number of estimated victims involved in human trafficking corresponds to 2.5 Million people who are forced in labor market (including sexual exploitation). The number of countries involved is 161, which are some how involved as an origin, transit or destination country (UNGIFT, n.d.).

### **1.1.2. Definition**

The definition of human trafficking is recognized on an international scale and it is expressed in the “Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children” known as the Palermo Protocol. The UN specialized Committee on the Elaboration of a Convention against Transnational Organized Crime submitted proposals in January 1999 for different protocols on the smuggling of migrants and the trafficking of human beings, in particular, women and children. The official protocols were signed, by the General Assembly of the United Nations, in 2000 and came into force in 2003. Because of the agreement between different countries the Protocol represents the first main international instrument in the fight against human trafficking. It has been defined as the first significant step taken by the member states

tackling the problem through an international cooperative approach. In fact the intention behind is to facilitate convergences in national approaches, and try to find out a common way of dealing with an issue that could be defined as a global challenge. As the first article of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime states:

*“The purpose of this Convention is to promote cooperation to prevent and combat transnational organized crime more effectively.”<sup>1</sup>*

According to the agreed definitions, evince a clear distinction between smuggling migrants and trafficking of human beings, which are both forms of irregular migration. Smuggling is, in relation to the “Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air”:

*“‘Smuggling of migrants’ means the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident.”<sup>2</sup>*

The “Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air” considers as a crime the act of making profit from facilitating the illegal entry, or enabling the stay of people who are not nationals or permanent residents of a State; it therefore accuses the smugglers who crib migrants and not the migrants themselves. The criminals may provide several kinds of assistance for financial or material benefit, or

---

<sup>1</sup> Article 1 *Statement of purpose* (United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, 2000).

<sup>2</sup> Article 3; paragraph (a) (Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, 2000).

providing false documents during the travelling process. Frequently Smuggled migrants are abused or exposed to dangerous; sometimes even their life can be in danger. According to the current estimations the number of irregular migrants in the world corresponds to 50 million a considerable portion of these persons paid for help in crossing borders illegally (UNODC, 2012). While human trafficking is defined in accordance to the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children:

*“The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs”<sup>3</sup>.*

Even if the two crimes are distinct, there are a number of linkages between human trafficking and smuggling of migrants. The main difference is acclaimed by the consent of the person. Regarding smuggled migrants they agree on paying someone who would assist them crossing the border irregularly and enable them to stay in the destination country without being a national or a permanent resident, they will stipulate a kind of agreement that will terminate when the migrant will arrive in the destination country. While on the other hand, victims of trafficking do not consent, or maybe they consent at

---

<sup>3</sup>Article 3; paragraph (a) (Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, 2000).



the starting phase of the process but their consent becomes meaningless because of threats or use of force, coercion or abuse of power by the trafficker that will exploit him or her in the destination country. At the end, both crimes may comprehend irregular migration dynamics, in fact quite often happens that trafficked persons are smuggled across borders, and smuggled persons, because of their vulnerability and precarious situation, could easily become victims of human trafficking. At the end, the two phenomenon can be easily overlapped. The main risk of overlapping is that if trafficked victims are not identified as such, they not even receive the protection they deserve as a human right. According to the UN smuggling protocol, smuggled migrants are entitled of the recognition of certain rights, which will not be mentioned in this paper, but they are different from the one reserved to victims of human trafficking. That is one of the reasons why it is crucial two keep the two phenomenon separate (UNODC, 2012). Now that we have clarified the definitions we can focus in what exactly consists the trafficking of human beings. It normally consists in three main phases. In the first one, the victims are recruited, the second, they are transported, and in the third they are exploited. The recruitment phase can develop in different ways, the criminals or future exploiters use a wide range of methods that cannot be recognised just in one. In some cases, violent actions are involved and the victims are abducted and assaulted. In other cases the victims are tricked, the criminals offer them good job opportunities that do not actually exist and once they arrive in the destination country they force them into exploitive labor and critical living conditions. At the second stage, the victims travel in different ways and conditions, for example by land, sea or air, alone or in group circumstances. During their moving process they can cross legal or illegal borders or if they move inside one country no border at all. In the last phase, the exploitation stage,

the victims are forced to do what the exploiter says, for example having sex when they establish it, be sexually assaulted, work in places such as factories, restaurants, farms, mines, plantation, as domestic helpers in very critical conditions where they do not have any right, where they cannot rest, or no option to leave without their consent. Or where one of their organs is removed without their consent and also in an illegal environment. There are cases, especially children, where they have to beg for money, sell illegal drugs or fight as child soldiers (UNODC & UN.GIFT, 2010).

### **1.1.3. Dimensions of Human Trafficking**

The dimensions of human trafficking can be quite diverse but there is a majority, according to the UNODC Global report of trafficking in persons, represented by 79% of the victims which are trafficked for sexual exploitation. This target group is followed by an 18% trafficked for forced labor purpose. The women forced into prostitution tend to be the most visible; they are mainly working in the city centers or along highways. In fact sexual exploitation, is the type of trafficking which is most reported and documented, compared to other forms of exploitation that are under-reported like: forced or bonded labor domestic servitude, forced marriage, organ removal, exploitation of children in begging and warfare (UNODC, 2009). Because of the complex nature regarding the phenomenon there are many factors which need to be considered. The phenomenon does not have an established expression process. The characteristics of the phenomenon differ from one another depending on the nationality, the age, gender etc. That is why, the phenomenon taken into analysis, is a dynamic phenomenon where the criminals change and renew their ways of exploitation in order to be less visible and always different in order not to be caught by the police.

#### **1.1.4. Who can be identified as a potential victim**

Because of many differences and lack of data concerning victims, it becomes almost impossible to describe a typical victim of human trafficking. They arrive from different countries so they are part of different ethnic groups. Victims can be represented by children, women, transsexuals and men. Most of the victims are originally from developing countries where the conditions of poverty are high. Quite often they have an emigration project in mind in order to enhance their quality of life, but limited resources force them to use illegal channels to reach destination countries. Certain vulnerabilities characterize many potential victims, sometimes just because they are minors or very young, or, as mentioned above, poverty conditions which automatically reduce opportunities and create very harsh living conditions. Sometimes also their families put pressure or in some cases sell them in order to gain a better life (UNODC & UNGIFT, 2010). According to UN.GIFT the majority of victims are between 18 and 24 years old. An estimated number of 1.2 Million are children who are trafficked each year. 95% of the people involved are victims of physical and psychological violence during the trafficking process. 43% of the victims end up in the forced sexual labor market of which 98% are women and girls. 32% of the victims are used for forced economic exploitation, of which 56% is represented by women and girls (UN. GIFT, n.d.).

#### **1.1.5. What corresponds to a trafficker's profile**

The people who are recruiting victims is represented by 52% of men, 42% of women and 6% mixed groups of women and men. The victim in 54% of the cases does not know the recruiter while in 46% of the cases the victim has a kind of relationship with

the recruiter. In most of the known cases the recruiter comes originally from the same country of the victim (UN. GIFT, n.d.). The trafficker or trafficking organization can be very simple or more complex; it can be an individual or an organized trafficking network business. According to Schloenhardt, he demarcates different roles taken by participants of a certain organization.

He distinguished:

Investors: those who put forward funding for the operation, and oversee the entire process of trafficking. They are on the top of the organization and often the employees of the organization do not know them personally, so they are most of the time anonymously;

Recruiters: they are the one who recruit the potential victims and ensure their financial commitment. They can be part of the victim's community, have more or less the same cultural background;

Transporters: are the one who assist the victim while he or she is leaving their country of origin in every circumstance either by land, sea or air;

Corrupt public officials or protectors: they may assist in obtaining travel documents, or enable potential victims to enter/exit illegally a country;

Informers: who are gaining crucial information on matters such as border surveillance, immigration and transit procedures, asylum systems, law enforcement activities;

Guides and crew members: are responsible for moving the illegal migrants from one transit point to the other or helping the migrants to enter the destination country;

Debt-collectors: they are in the destination countries to collect the debts the victims have towards the organization that consented him or her to achieve the destination country;

Supporting personnel and specialists: may include local people at transit points who might provide accommodation and other assistance (Schloenhardt, quoted in Aronowitz, A., 2001).

## **1.2. Main research question**

*What barriers or challenges do local law enforcement and victim's service providers face in collaborating in responding to a trafficking case?*

The main research question, as it will be specified in part three in regard to research methods, will be answered by using qualitative methods and a constant literature review during the whole process of the research will be done.

## **1.3. Objectives of the research**

The research study is formulated to develop a general understanding, directly by interviewing professionals involved, whether the expected cooperative way of working between two different stakeholders has been achieved. Even if it will explain and give general view about the phenomenon it will narrow down and focusing on the main research question and try to answer it in the most proper way. On one hand, research will be on law enforcement's perceptions and their investigation experience towards human trafficking, on the other: how victim's social service providers work and deal with human trafficking cases and the general cooperation dynamics between them. It is also conducted in order to recognize which are the problems in order to understand the main causes of them. Because of the comparative nature of the research, the

Netherlands and Italy will be analyzed; it will be particularly interesting to see if both countries present more or less the same critical aspects, what could be a concrete alternative, or possible solutions regarding cooperation issues. This study focuses on detecting the positive factors in both countries and see how compatible they can be applied on a different national system. Going in depth through both countries, try to identify models of good practicing. What are the vulnerabilities of each profession and which are the strengths in managing a human trafficking case. How do Law enforcement and Social service providers follow the principle of collaboration and cooperation responding to problems towards a multidisciplinary approach. Find out the critical aspects and which the linking channels between social workers and practitioners are in the criminal justice system. The whole research will be a small and limited contribution to the fight against human trafficking; it will be an informative research and will contribute to the general awareness and knowledge about human trafficking phenomenon.

#### **1.4. Personal motivation**

My personal motivation is mainly detected by my great interest and sensitivity towards the topic which rose significantly in the last years during my university studies. As a consequence the choice to write a bachelor and master thesis about it gave me the opportunity to go deeper into the topic and try to understand its multifaceted characteristics. Even if the topic is quit recent, some great research has been done already. However, this should just represent a starting point! On the basis of previous researches it will be easier to identify needs and new inputs in order to develop new studies. I tend to think that, due to the complexity of the phenomenon, constant research needs to be conducted, even if it will not have a great relevance, it is still important not

to underestimate your personal work even if your contribution will just be on an academic level. Both Italy and the Netherlands are two countries which are particularly involved and it is for me very interesting as a half Dutch, half Italian person to understand how these countries, which are very different in their history, political situation and welfare states, respond to prevent and combat human trafficking. I strongly believe that social research, in general, has to be done in order to report what current societies' issue are and as a consequence social policy should change and adapt on the basis of empirical research carried out by experts. A central focus of sociological research is systematic attention on causes and consequences of social inequalities. It is important raise people's awareness about facts that are not always considered by authorities how they should be. An analysis about the problem of human trafficking is, as mentioned above, constantly required; also because it assumes different forms and traffickers always adapt and change the dynamics to make the phenomenon less and less visible and contrast the fighting and preventive measures taken by different states. So, I would state that even if the phenomenon has been investigated over the past decades by States still it is not enough and many gaps need to be filled in.

## **2. PART TWO COOPERATION BETWEEN LAW ENFORCEMENT AND SERVICE PROVIDERS**

This chapter will go more in details regarding the characteristics of cooperation between law enforcements and service providers. How cooperation should or has been achieved. But firstly a brief description about professional's roles will be given, in order to understand why and how they cooperate.

### **2.1. Law enforcements and Service providers**

The choice to describe these two professions is dictated by the central research question which is demanding particularly about cooperation between law enforcements and service providers.

#### **2.1.1. Law enforcement**

Law enforcements are responsible for the investigation of the crime of trafficking in human beings. The main aim is to investigate on traffickers and prove they committed a crime. They try to collect facts and evidences needed to convict perpetrators of the crime. They also try, somehow, to convince victims or damaged parties to testify so that they can achieve their goals and bring justice (Debabrata, 2007).

#### **2.1.2. Service providers**

The central aim of service providers is to support victim and assist her/him during the whole protection procedure, regardless they are cooperating or not with the law



enforcement. Through professional help, they support victims in processing their experiences, they try to claim their rights and try to encourage them in the perspective of a new, better future. The working goal is to create conditions that enable victims to regain self esteem, re- establish their physical and psychological health and recognize their rights. They can assist them at the beginning of the protection procedure, they can provide victims with special accommodation, inform about Social Law and residence permit rights related to the status of being a victim of human trafficking. Through psychological support they try to make victims more emotionally stable and create conditions where they would feel more conscious on their will to report traffickers or not. If the victim will choose to report her/his experience, service providers will assist them during the whole criminal proceeding (Rescue & Restore, 2011).

### **2.1.3. A relationship of interdependency**

Both professions work within a legal regulation framework and they are strongly dependent from one another. When the police have firstly contact with an identified victim, they should establish as soon as possible contact with service providers in order to facilitate investigation proceedings. But also, when the service providers perceive that the victim is somehow in danger they should contact the police and ask for special protective measures. For example when a victim decides to report the trafficker, in these cases behind him/her should be strong cooperation mechanisms between the two entities. There should be a standardized method of assessing situations and provide jointly agreed programs of protection for victims but also for those who are assisting them. So, at the end it must be underlined the importance of cooperation because not only the professions, but also, and especially, victims will benefit from it. Once the need

for cooperation has been mutually recognized, they have to build strategies on how to work together. The strategies should be expressed in an appropriate written cooperation agreement, so that it becomes a real work tool for both professions (BMFSFJ, 2007).

## **2.2. Cooperation in accordance to the Palermo Protocol**

Trafficking in human beings is a complex phenomenon with many dimensions, as we have already described in the first chapter. In fact responses to trafficking must be multi-disciplinary and well-coordinated because a variety of actors involved in addressing different aspects of the problem. A holistic approach should be provided to better response to the growing problem of trafficking in human beings. As described in chapter one, it is a multifaceted phenomenon and it is evident that no single country, no single institution or agency will be able to tackle and solve the problem without cooperation of other entities involved. As a consequence, cooperation plays a key role in anti-trafficking activities, many organizations, which are working with victims in fact operate through a cooperative approach and try to, constantly, enhance the cooperation dynamics between the different stakeholders. According to the Palermo Protocol several are the articles where cooperation is seen as a central aim to achieve. In the attached Annex 2 it will be possible to consult all the Articles which refer to cooperation and are contained in the Palermo Protocol. In general, what emerges through these articles is the need to establish a comprehensive way of working with common policies, programs and measures between different stakeholders in order to prevent the phenomenon, to assist victims through a multidisciplinary approach and prevent potential re-victimization. The need to have a constant information exchange is mentioned, but also the need to take part on common trainings. So, in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish

Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children the importance of cooperation is emphasized, mainly seen as means to achieve the overall objectives (Palermo Protocol, 2000). However, the Palermo protocol is not the only tool which refers to cooperation, if we also take into analysis the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (COE, 2005) also there, the relevance of cooperation is mentioned and underlined in a number of provisions like Articles 29 and 35. The EU Action Plan also emphasizes the importance of co-ordination in the success of anti-trafficking efforts. Many other are sources that support a comprehensive approach like: ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, or the Joint ECCAS/ECOWAS Plan of Action against Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children in West and Central Africa<sup>4</sup> and, still, many others. The development of this demand is due to the fact that in the years a certain sureness regarding effectiveness of a harmonized cooperative approach towards human trafficking has been achieved. As a consequence we could state that the operational rationale behind cooperation is recognized and reinforced by all relevant international conventions, protocols, directives and European initiatives on the subject of trafficking in human beings. However, efforts at an international level are not always sufficient. They need to be implemented and adapted on a local perspective, which provides a better setting for closer cooperation, facilitated by a stronger feeling of ownership and greater adaptability to local dimensions and realities on the ground. The purpose of this comparative research is to understand how, locally, in the Netherlands and in Italy cooperation dynamics developed over the years by analyzing the perspectives of two different stakeholders. In the next chapter we will

---

<sup>4</sup> For further details consult: list of definitions

go more in details regarding the two countries while this chapter will just follow a more general track, underlining more how it should be.

### **2.3. The importance of cooperation**

In this part we will observe and focus on what are the challenges regarding the management and the effective way of cooperating that may confront the different actors involved in the fight against human trafficking but also what is, on the other hand, perceived as being good practice will be described later in part 4.1. So, we will focus, on the basis of the Articles mentioned above how, practically, cooperation works or should work. Currently, the constant developing of anti trafficking measures has recognized equal importance to all the professions involved, from law enforcement, prosecutors, health professionals, community sector and members of the community. It is supported by several experts that all professionals, independently from their mandates, who get in touch with victims of human trafficking need always to consider the vulnerability of the person, involved. It is a very sensitive situation where, most of the times, because of their experience, victims are traumatized so everyone who represents her/his first contact, should be very careful in not further harming the person. There are cases where the person does not perceive her/him self as a victim, where may are these contradictory, ambivalent feelings. The situations can differ from one another, because of the complex nature it can be very difficult to approach the woman/man and establish a trustful situation, pretend a cooperative attitude from their side, acquire truthful responses and fully pretend to comprehend their decisions and reactions. What is hardly recommended, in order to facilitate the process, is to adopt an appropriate ethically correct approach, where the victim will not be judged and will be treated with

opportune sensitivity. As long as the woman/man will feel respected and that her/his welfare represents a priority or somehow considered as central, she/he will be more likely to share their story and experience also in regard to intimate details (WHO, 2003). The ways how victims get in touch with those professions listed above and escape from the criminal organization which is reaping profit from him/her, can really differ from one and another. Some countries provide an Anti-trafficking number that provides general information and advice about the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings; the victims can call in case of emergency or just have a counseling session. Italy is an example of a country that provides this kind of assistance. It is a free number, and they provide help, information and advice (Heather & al., 2001). The first contact with the victim can also be represented by the police, it can occur in different contexts depending on which exploitative system the victim is involved. Usually, specific trained police officers are in the front line, where the way of interviewing and investigating is made on the basis of certain methods (<http://www.soca.gov.uk/>, 16/05/12). For police officers, it can sometimes be even harder to identify a victim because of victim's fear toward the police in general. They, sometimes, have their documents confiscated by the traffickers so they are staying in the country illegally and are afraid to be imprisoned or deported automatically back to their own country by the police. So, they perceive the police more as a danger or intimidation rather than an alternative to their current situation. Many times, they have this mistrust toward authorities because, in their countries of origin, the police is most of the times corrupted and will treat them in a hostile and unhelpful manner. (WHO, 2003). In other cases victims' first contact are directly the NGOs, they approach victims through certain specialized street groups, or they have specific drop in centers where victims arrive after a case is recognized as a case of human trafficking.

Street groups are different professions like, social workers, cultural mediators and volunteers who drive around the main streets where prostitutes are working and try to identify victims of trafficking. They try to establish a trustful relationship with prostitutes, conducting preventive actions while informing them about human trafficking, provide information about available alternatives in order to escape and abandon the prostitution and exploitation circumstances, general preventive medicine information, information, most of the times, is provided in different languages, monitor the situation, inform relevant members of local community and provide, eventually, an accompanying service to victims who need medical help. While, the professionals working for drop in centers are mainly social workers, legal specialists, psychologists, cultural mediators etc. They assist victims and provide different services like legal and social counseling, specialized assistance programs, preventive medicine advice and accompanying prostitutes to receive medical assistance (Heather & al., 2001). In order to have a harmonized way of working and enhance the effectiveness of actions a cooperative approach between all stakeholders should be undertaken. The information should be shared while everybody preserves its role. As Holmes states, to response effectively to the problem the actions must be multi-agencies and the two main involved organisms are law enforcement agencies, intergovernmental and non governmental organizations that provide assistance to victims. These two entities, in order to offer a holistic response to trafficking of human beings, should cooperate within four inter-related categories:

- a) *Prevention by reducing the number of available victims - through education and awareness raising campaigns.*

*b) Prevention by reducing the number of traffickers – through successful identification, investigation and prosecution.*

*c) Victim assistance- rescue, care and support, repatriation and reintegration.*

*d) Victim- witness assistance- physical and judicial protection(Holmes, 2002: p.45)*

Holmes adds, during the different phases, both agencies should work towards the same common humanitarian purpose to prevent and reduce trafficking. They should assist victims and punish criminals. Both sides should accept the interdependency between each other. Law enforcement should accept their dependence from NGOs especially regarding:

- *Endemic lack of trust in law enforcement, it is more NGOs' role to build relationships of trust with trafficking victims;*
- *High-grade intelligence critical to the successful identification and investigation of traffickers is likely to be provided to NGOs and not police;*
- *NGOs have the specialist skills and experience to treat, counsel and accommodate the victims whom investigators wish to convert witnesses.*

At the same time NGOs should be aware and approve their dependency from law enforcement regarding:

- *Legal powers and resources to respond to requests to remove victims from exploitative situations;*
- *Referral of trafficked victims to NGOs;*
- *Protection to victims and NGOs personnel. (Holmes, 2002: p. 5-6)*

Once the interdependency dynamics are accepted, it is easier to develop a mutual recognition and an effective cooperation. A key common goal should be the willingness to reduce the number of victims. Reach this aim means maximize the joint potential of

law enforcement agencies and inter and non- governmental organizations in identifying, prosecuting and convicting traffickers (Holmes, 2002). But still it has to be done conducting a shared victim-centered approach, and human-rights approach. According to Rijken and Koster, the crime is too often approached from a criminal law perspective where the overall reading goal is to catch the persecutors. This kind of approach reduces the attention towards the victims. The victim is essential mainly for the penal procedure. In fact in many countries the protection of the victim is dependent from victim's cooperation to criminal proceedings. Due to the fact that human trafficking brings together the violation of a broad number of human rights, a response to these violations should be a holistic approach based on the promotion and respect of human rights. In this approach the victim is in the centre, and the criminal law is part of it but not central (Rijken & Koster, 2008).

#### **2.4. The Memorandum of Understanding**

In accordance to many experts the adoption of a MoUs is seen as the most effective formalized cooperation agreement between stakeholders which deal with human trafficking. MoUs<sup>5</sup> represent a right tool of formalized cooperation they enhance victim's assistance and protection and their willingness to cooperate with the police. As a consequence, the probabilities to catch the traffickers can automatically rise. A several number of benefits can be linked to the adoption of a MoU. First of all, the parties' role is clearly identified, more transparency in working dynamics is provided. Secondly it can be interpreted as a measure to evaluate the effectiveness of cooperation. In fact it is most of the times, highly recommended to include in the MoU a provision on

---

<sup>5</sup> For further details consult: List of definitions



evaluation, which allows an evaluation, preferably from an independent body, and leads to improvement. It also helps to recognize party's limitations and commitments. Even though, professionals involved have their own responsibilities in accordance to their values and mandate, and these agreements should not affect their independence and their autonomy in conducting their jobs. In fact the MoU, in order to prevent or reduce conflicts, is supposed to define the responsibilities, obligations, duties and roles of the stakeholders. Providing a detailed definition on how the relationship should be structured it should contribute building the trust between entities included in the agreement. To build a MoU, it is important to identify partners and understand what kind of non-formalized cooperation already exists. For example there are cases where informal cooperation is established between professions on the basis of personal contact. In these cases the relationships can be interrupted as a result of changing personnel, and losing automatically a cooperative attitude. Most of the times MoUs are agreed between partners of governmental and non-governmental agencies, particularly police and NGOs or other service providers for victims of human trafficking. In any case, stakeholders can come from different fields of expertise in combating human trafficking. The identification of partners is strictly related to the main purpose of the agreement, which needs to be determinate by the stakeholders concerned (UN.GIFT & OIM, 2009).

#### **2.4.1. Benefits and potential risks of a MoU**

As it is clearly expressed in the UN. GIFT report, seen from different entities' perspectives, there are concrete advantages in adopting a MoU. From Law enforcement's position benefits can be linked to the identification stage. The

identification of the victim can be performed by different stakeholders, not only the police but also outreach work by NGOs professionals, local authorities or hotlines. As a consequence it emphasizes the fact that cooperation with specialized service providers is very valuable and can facilitate and enhance the identification process of potential victims. But not only during the identification phase cooperation plays a key role, once a presumed victim is identified, on the basis of an agreement, law enforcement can facilitate the process of providing victims with proper accommodation and assistance. More in general, sharing functions and responsibilities give law enforcement the opportunity to focus more on their obligations regarding prosecution and investigation. When a victim is supported by service providers she/he are more likely to cooperate with law enforcement and as a consequence it accelerates, somehow, the investigation procedures and at the same time increase the chances of a successful prosecution. On the other hand if we look from service provider's perspective benefits can be mainly attributed to a common understanding of roles and with it a higher transparency, and a higher number of identified victims. Specialized service providers contribute to the development of a balanced victim-center approach to victims of human trafficking. In fact Cooperation agreement will, also, lead to a higher awareness of law enforcement agencies concerning the rights and needs of trafficked victims. Professionals from the service providers can better support victims during the criminal procedure and securing access to justice. They will be able to ensure protection of victim's rights during the criminal proceeding and their access to compensation. Even though, there are also some risks that should be considered and prevented, for example specific service providers are attached to the principle of confidentiality that has to be respected, at least the victim gives her/his consent. Cooperation with law enforcement can lead to the risk of personal

safety of the trafficked person and the staffs, so specific security measures need to be undertaken to prevent this possibility (UN.GIFT & OIM, 2009).

## **2.5. Good practice concerning cooperation: the German case**

According to all different cooperation agreements and operational models, spread all over Europe, Germany corresponds to an example of good practice. The model, we will describe in this paragraph, became an important reference point within the various German states and is considered as best practice at European and international level. In 1999, a Federal Working Group on Trafficking in Women and Violence against women in the migration process<sup>6</sup> was established. It significantly contributed to the multi-disciplinary development of appropriate strategies and initiatives against trafficking in women. The aim of the establishment of this group was to facilitate professional exchange between stakeholders, work together and try to have a clear idea, nationally but also internationally, on what are the current initiatives and activities against trafficking in women\trafficking in human beings, try to focus on a victim-centered approach and solve or tackle the practical problems and also develop and improve best practice models in order to inform decision makers and\or involved centers for the purpose of multidisciplinary changes. The entities involved were the Federal Criminal Police Office, professionals from specialized counseling centers and the KOK e.V. the main common goal was, as already mentioned, enhance victim's protection. It clearly distinguished the areas of responsibility of counseling centers and police and concentrated more on the types and manners of cooperation they were supposed to adopt. The operating methods, perceived as new, were explicitly expressed and

---

<sup>6</sup> For further details consult: List of definitions

suggested to all federal states as a recommendation from the Federal Working Group on Trafficking in Women. At that time, the Police used the suggested cooperation methodology as a tool work and recognized the effectiveness in it. After approximately ten years the cooperation concept was evaluated and revised. The evaluation was conducted by KOK. From the analysis, it resulted that cooperation agreements were interpreted as a significant positive tool by police departments and assistance centers. What also emerged was the need for a more precise cooperation agreement expressing a clear distinction between professional's responsibilities, in order to facilitate practical cooperation and accept cooperation agreements. But also, the necessity of regular interdisciplinary trainings in order to clarify roles and enhance cooperation relationships. These kind of multidisciplinary education courses are in fact perceived as particularly relevant to let professional groups dealing with trafficking in human beings familiarize with changes of law and the introduction of other innovative measures in order to guarantee an effective interdisciplinary cooperation. During these courses is perceived as important to highlight the different modus operandi, promote intercultural communication, share information, workshops and develop interdisciplinary competences. As a consequence of this study some things were improved and changed such as, providing a more detailed description on cooperation principles, describing more clearly target groups and making clearer recommendations to states such as, locate special police departments that are responsible for the coordination of protection measures, guarantee service providers to support victims, support and provide regular interdisciplinary trainings and establish regular meetings between different stakeholders. To Sum up, the German model shows how formal cooperation agreements can be established and be successful. Even though, there are still some German states

that did not adopt a formal cooperation agreement, and still work on the basis of individual's cooperation agreements, even if highly recommended by KOK's evaluation conducted in 2007 (BMFSFJ, 2007).

### **2.5.1. Weak points of the German Model**

The German model, even if it has been received with great interest by the international community, presents some areas of conflict. There has been detected the risk that the work conducted by counseling centers and the statements made by the victims can be instrumentalised in the interest of criminal prosecution. In this case, due to the lack of humanitarian regulations in the German Law, victims will be allowed to stay legally in the country only if they cooperate with the prosecuting office and if the case is dismissed or there is no need to have the witness she/he will be obliged to leave Germany. In these cases we have a distinctive power position in favor of the police, but in these kinds of situations the responsibility should be attributed to decision makers more than to professionals, who are just respecting their mandates. These areas of conflict are still going on, nonetheless cooperation agreements are perceived as a good tool in regard to cooperation between police and assistance centers when they are developed together, regularly evaluated and the conflicts are openly discussed and properly tackled. Cooperation in order to be successful requires recognition and knowledge of the different objectives from both sides, and the respective tasks should be clearly interpreted by the victim's perspectives (BMFSFJ, 2007).

## **2.6. Good practice concerning victim's protection system: the Italian case**

The Italian legal system provides a very good approach in regard to protection of victims. At central and local level, Italian public authorities in cooperation with civil society organizations provide full social protection to victims of human trafficking (Cartabia & al., n.d.). As it will be described in part four, the Italian protection system is recognized as being a European model because of the central position of victims during the whole assistance process. The adopted approach is a victim centered approach, where victims are fully assisted independently from their cooperation to the penal proceeding. The human rights based approach do not exclude criminal law, it just emphasizes the vulnerable position of victims and underlines the importance of including assisting and protective measures as first. (Rijken & Koster, 2008). The exceptional nature of victim-centered Italian policy has resulted as being particularly effective also in regard to traffickers' convictions. In many cases victims as a result of a successful assistance project decide to report their exploiters. This universalistic approach gives persons and their status of being victims a relevant position, where the trafficked person represents the offended part. It does not mean that she/he has to collaborate with the penal procedure and that she/he has to testify during the penal procedure. The philosophy behind is that the person in order to be part of the penal proceeding needs to have their rights recognized. She/he has to find again suitable energy, more favorable life's conditions and particularly a safe place guaranteed in order to be protected from possible retaliations (Carchedi, 2007).

## **2.7. How to lead cooperation to improvement**

Still according to Holmes' recommendations a European Multi- Agency Experts group should be established, and should have the function of monitoring the different realities. The tasks of the group will be in concern to research activities, design and publish a set of minimum standards and best practice models in respect of all forms of law enforcement and intergovernmental and non-governmental organization co-operation. The aim would be to create a model for cooperation activities even though it has to be very flexible so that every state will be eligible to apply it and eventually adapt it to their local conditions. The objective is to create an entity that establishes a coherent and coordinated strategy that can be applied across the European member's states. The group should be composed by experts in the field coming from different professional backgrounds, also working already for important international entities like, Europol, or relevant NGOs. Another suggestion made by Holmes is in regard to create another small group of experts at a European level with a monitor function. Namely, they are supposed to control if the states are respecting and implementing the minimum standards and best practices models established by the Multi-Agency experts groups. He also recommends a European network of intergovernmental and non governmental organizations with one focal point in every country. Lastly he suggests the development of an ad hoc protocol based on cooperation between law enforcement and intergovernmental and non governmental organizations, who develop research on cooperation and deliver case history based trainings (Holmes, 2002).

### **3. PART THREE METHODS**

This chapter is going to present two different European countries which are particularly involved in human trafficking as transit or destination country: Italy and the Netherlands. Both countries, as it will be explained more in detail forward, present two different victim's protection systems with same objectives but achieved in different ways: encouraging the victim to testify and protecting the victim's human rights (Anti-Slavery International, 2002). The main difference is characterized by the connection between social protection and criminal procedure. In the Italian case we will see that the protection of victims goes independently from the victim's report while the Dutch case, in the second phase of the B-9, the support and assistance of the victim is strictly related to her/his report. In the explanations reported below, the reader would have the possibility to understand how the Netherlands and Italy deal with the issue of Human Trafficking and which are the national procedures that victims are required to undertake. In second part of the chapter, an accurate description of the methods used and the reasons why certain methods were used to answer the main research question will be given.

#### **3.1. The Dutch case**

The Netherlands is a country which is particularly involved in the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings. The people who are trafficked are men women and children trafficked for the purpose of exploitation in the sex industry, forced labor and services. Women represent the majority of victims of human trafficking, their ages are between 18 and 30 trafficked into sex industry. The Netherlands can be represented as a country of transit as destination. Differently from the Italian case, the Netherlands is



also an origin country. The real number of victims is still unclear, the available data are referred to registered victims, there is probably large number of cases where it is not established if it is a victim or not. According to the data collected by NRM the number of reported victims has been tripled from 341 to 909 in the last ten years. The major number of victim's nationality is represented by Dutch, followed by Nigerian, Bulgarian and Romanian and the main purpose is sexual exploitation and forced labor (BNRM, 2010). In 2011, the government reported an increased number of underage Dutch residents as victims, who are increasingly significantly. These girls are controlled through force and violence and recruited, most of the times, over the Internet. The victimization of Dutch girls, has received, in the last years, an increasing emphasizes from the media. Until now, only the Netherlands is tackling concretely the problem through research and proper prevention and assistance, even if also other countries seem to be affected by it; for example Germany. This process of victimization of young Dutch girls is carried out by the so-called loverboys. The phenomenon of loverboys lies under the wider concept of human trafficking, it is a new term which has been used lately to define the methodology or procedure that human traffickers follow to exploit the victims. The typical methods of loverboys include specific methods of the so-called grooming and recruitment. The applied methods have different manifestation and are variable in nature. The loverboy's phenomenon is distinguished by other kinds of exploitation of human trafficking. The victims are usually underage or very young under twenty three girls. The lover-boy phenomenon involves young 'charming' men who use different means to make minors and or young women to fall in love with them and after a short period of time lures her into prostitution. Usually the procedure involves threatening or blackmailing, and can also deal with forced drug-dealing or

other legal ways of providing the pimps with financial help, such as bank loans. More in general there are different ways of exploitation that can be differing in each case (Pretty women, n.d.).

### **3.1.1. Prevention**

In regard to preventive measures, the Netherlands approaches the problem innovatively. In order to enhance public awareness, in 2011, the government-funded victims' protection agency, approved a social media campaign about other forms of exploitation, beside sex industry, as a consequence of trafficking of human beings. In August 2011 the Police conducted an Internet session to divulge about practices adopted by pimps who are seducing young women and then force them into sex trafficking and forced prostitution in the Netherlands. The scope was to inform young girls about the risks and consequences of the phenomenon. In regard to international victims of human trafficking, in July 2011, the human trafficking task force presented its 2011-2014 action plan. In this action plan, a field study analysis of seven human trafficking cases involved in forced labor and sex trafficking is going to be included and identified as sources of best practices in criminal investigations. On the other hand, regarding national victims of human trafficking, the task force published a second national action plan 2011-2014 to tackle trafficking that is involving local resident exploiters and Dutch girls. In 2011 an awareness campaign was organized by the Social Affairs Ministry to inform citizens and certain target groups, such trade unions and work councils about the existence of labor exploitation in the Netherlands (Department of States, 2012).

### **3.1.2. The B9 Regulations**

The Netherlands was the first country to adopt a specific policy concerning temporary residency rights to victims trafficked into the sex industry. The B9 regulation can be seen as the parallel Dutch tool of Article 18 in Italy, but it presents certain differences. The B9 is part of the Aliens Act Implementation Guidelines and came into force in 2000. It focuses on victims or witnesses of human trafficking and allows them to remain legally on the Dutch soil. Once a victim is identified the B9 allows three month reflection period, also called the “reflection delay” when victims or witnesses can decide or not to cooperate in criminal proceedings. The decision to issue a reflection delay is dependent upon a police officer or lawyer interviewing the person concerned. However, the last decision is made by a senior police officer. The police officer will inform the IND and the STV that the person has a suspension of deportation order for three months. The STV is responsible for coordinating reception and accommodation for the person, as well as arranging a case manager for the case (Anti-Slavery International, 2002). So, during these three months the victim has the right to stay legally in the Netherlands and is entitled to different welfare benefits in order to elaborate her/his decision. Afterwards, if she/he decides not to report the trafficker/s, she/he has to repatriate to the country of origin. If the victim or the witnesses decides to collaborate with the authorities this will grant him/her a residence permit. The length of this residence permit, maximum three years, is related to the duration of the investigation and criminal proceeding and it expires when the investigation or the prosecution is completed or stopped. During this period of cooperation with the police victims have the right to social and psychological care, medical assistance, legal assistance, to work etc. If this period of cooperation results in a conviction of the

trafficker/s the victim will automatically receive a permanent residence permit, if not she/he could apply for a residence permit on humanitarian grounds (BNRM, 2003).

### **3.1.3. Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel**

Since April 2000 the Netherlands has an independent national rapporteur of trafficking in human beings, NRM which reports how the Netherlands deal with Human Beings and Sexual Violence against Children analyzing from different angles. The staff members, together composes the BNRM. The main role of the BNRM is to report all information and relevant regulations and legislation in regard to human trafficking. They also inform about criminal investigations processes, prevention measures and prosecution of exploiters and victim's support as policy recommendations with the aim to improve the fight against human trafficking and sexual violence against children. As written above, they work independently and the main function is to report to the Dutch governments. It is important to mention that, with its function the BNRM does not have any power on criminal investigations. Afterwards, governments refer to Parliament. The reports are, anyway, public and can be consulted on the web site. The rapporteur, to obtain information, has an important net work with organizations and authorities involved in the prevention and combating of human trafficking and sexual violence against children and in providing assistance to victims. With the police and judicial authorities they have a special relationship where they are allowed to access criminal files to gain information. They also cooperate with organizations abroad because of the international features of the phenomenon (<http://www.bnrm.nl/>, 19/12/11).

## **3.2. The Italian Case**

Italy, as the Netherlands, represents a transit and destination country. The Italian system does not provide a National Rapporteur. However at the end of 2007 the Department of Rights and Equal Opportunities of the Prime Minister's Office established a permanent Osservatorio sul fenomeno della Tratta degli esseri Umani. The Observatory's activities are coordinated by the Chief Officer of the Department of Rights and Equal Opportunities, supported by Department staff. The Observatory is responsible for collecting and compiling national data on the issue ([www.osservatorionazionaletratta.it](http://www.osservatorionazionaletratta.it), 23/10/11). At the moment the available data referred to victims which have chosen to participate to a protection program. During the 12 years of application of the law (Article 18 of the Legislative Decree n°286 of 1998) around 18.000 victims received assistance and support. Almost half of them were able to find a job. Nigerians, followed by Rumanian are the most represented groups of victims in many parts of Italy. The main reason why the victims are trafficked to Italy is for sexual exploitation (European Union, 2011).

### **3.2.1. Prevention**

In 2011 the Ministry for Equal Opportunity, through a committee that included independent experts and NGOs, developed the first national action plan on trafficking in human beings. The draft of the plan was submitted to the Parliament in January 2012. Many national experts sustain that the euro crises has increased the number of unemployed foreign workers in the country and automatically their vulnerability to labor exploitation. In respond to this, in August 2011 the government issued a decree to criminalize and increase penalties for labor brokers with the aim to reduce exploitation

conditions. By systematically monitoring on a regional and national level, it appears as the government has demonstrate transparency in its anti-trafficking efforts, but still there is a lack of public reports in regard to measures adopted to address the problem (Department of States, 2012).

### **3.2.2. Law**

In Italy the historical process in regard to victim´s protection from traffickers started in 1998. The Law is Law n. 40/1998 called “Disciplina dell’immigrazione e norme sulla condizione dello straniero” and is part of the immigration national law. Some articles are particularly relevant playing a key role concerning protection measures for victims. Article 12, refers to the crime of recruiting illegal migrants and force them into prostitution or recruitment of minors and involve them in criminal activities. However, the key article of the whole law is represented by article 18, because of its importance, in part 3.2.3. We will provide a detailed description in order to have a clearer idea. Another significant law is “Misure contro la tratta di persone”, adopted under number 228 on 11<sup>th</sup> of August 2003. Where all the indications given by the Palermo Protocols of 2000 are considered, and have lead to a penal code change in regard to article s 600, 601 and 602 when a person is forced in a condition of slavery (Baldoni, 2007).

### **3.2.3. Article 13 and Article 18**

In comparison to the Netherlands, no special provision exists in the Italian legal system on a reflection period insofar as legislation considers the possibility of granting a residence permit for reasons of social protection. Article 13 of the Law 228/2003 provides victims with temporary (three to six months’) assistance; it establishes an ad hoc special aid program which is granting suitable accommodation and health care to

trafficked victims. Article 13 programs' are financed by a special fund, it provides victims a special secret accommodation so that they are protected by criminal organizations' threats (Cartabia & al., n.d.). Another central provision for victim's of human trafficking is article 18 of Law 286/1998. Article 18 is a humanitarian provision contained in the Italian immigration law, which allows immigrant women, men or children to escape from the criminal organization that is exploiting them and find a concrete alternative where they can participate to an assistance program, they can be reintegrated into society and obtain a residence permit. On a European level, as we already mentioned it in chapter 2, Article 18 represents an innovative tool in fighting human trafficking. In most of European countries, victims of human trafficking are eligible to obtain temporary residence permits, just in case they decide to collaborate with the police. The distinctive approach adopted by Article 18 is attributed to the central position of the victim and the enhancement of the output paths from exploitation systems. The aim is the fight against the crime while recognizing full citizens rights to the persons involved. The Questore recognizes, to the illegal immigrant, the right to obtain a residence permit due to protection reasons from a critical risky situation. In case of evidence, in regard to violence or serious exploitation dynamics, victims have the right to be protected. But not only if victims' decide to report his/her situation also when victims are in danger because of their decision to leave the criminal organization and start a new life. Article 18 impersonates a real alternative for victims whether she/he wants to report or not. In fact once, victims, decide to leave the criminal organizations they can choose between two different paths: the juridical path or the social path. These measures are particularly innovative as provide two possible routes for a victim of trafficking, one social and one judicial; with no risk that one will be

influenced by the other. Indeed, in the juridical path, the victim is expected to cooperate with the authorities and has to report the trafficker to the police; it means she/he has to be involved in the penal procedure as a witness. As a consequence, he/she will obtain a residence permit. On the other hand, the social path is undertaken when victims decide not to cooperate directly with police. Most of the times, service providers detect a dimension of violence and intimidation concerning victims, even if the person did not report the criminal organization. In these cases service providers, in order to help victims to obtain a resident permit, submit a request to the authorities after checking the conditions established by the law. The latter, does not expect the immediate report from the victims even though it guarantees the respect for victim's rights. The intent of the law is to accompany victims through the social path, until they elaborate their decisions to report the exploiters. This particular path has proven that many times the complaint from victims represents the arrival point. In other words, victims feel safe, their rights are guaranteed, they find a real alternative and have time to elaborate what happened, all this helps to create certain conditions where victims at the end of the whole process decide independently to cooperate with the authorities and take part to penal procedures. Even in cases where victims still did not feel ready to report and decided not to cooperate directly with the police, it has create certain conditions where information exchange has lead to relevant developments regarding the fight against trafficking in human beings. So, even if the paths are two, the central aim is still represented by the fight against the crime, and at the same time guarantees victim's rights. The issued residence permit is valid for six months and can be renewed for one year. It can also be renovated according to the duration of the criminal procedure as a residence permit based on humanitarian grounds. During this period victims are allowed to work and



have access to the educational system, in fact in some cases the residence permit can be transformed in a permanent residence permit for work or education reasons. It is in particular this “transformation” characteristic that needs to be underlined. The emphasis needs to be given on the fact that the residence permit is not only linked to penal procedures’ cooperation but it is seen as a concrete tool to help person’s obtain a legal status and as a consequence receive citizens’ rights. Compared to other European approaches, the success expressed through the Italian experience demonstrates that victim’s cooperation cannot be, automatically, expected if we do not previously work on creating certain conditions where victims feel safe and have his/her rights guaranteed. Still, there are some weaknesses that can be identified in Article 18. According to Ferone, the lack of attention towards victim’s family members in countries of origin, the lack of coordination between Article 18 and Law dedicated to witnesses’ protection, bourocratic procedures to issue residence permits for social protection that often slow down the whole process and, more in general, the bad influences caused by restrictive approaches adopted in the last years by different Italian governments in regard to immigration. Regarding foreign minors victims of trafficking, they receive an automatic residence permit until they achieve adult’s age that, according to Italian’s law, corresponds to 18. The local government entities and the NGOs providing assistance and social integration programs, established by Article 18 of the 1998 Italian Law on Immigration and the special programs provided by Article 13 of Law n. 228/2003 have to adapt their interventions to the specific needs of the trafficked victims, independently from their age (Cartabia & al., n.d.). To sum up, victims are not obliged to cooperate with police officers in order to receive a residence permit, the philosophy behind, is that it is given for granted because their rights need to be

respected. According to data collection of 2011, 1,078 temporary residence permits for protection from exploitive situations were issued by the Italian government. From these numbers 608 were renewed to residence permits in the same year. The most involved nationalities of the assisted victims were Nigerians, Romanians and Moroccans. 68% of the assisted victims cooperated with the police during the investigation period while they were included in the protection programs. It is important to mention that the situations in Italy vary on the basis of local realities. In certain regions there are proved arrangements to help guide officials in identifying and referring trafficked victims, but still governments should adopt formal procedures on a national level for all front-line responders in Italy. The current political situation has implemented anti-immigration security laws and policies; as a consequence fines for illegal migrants and their expedited expulsion from Italy has increased, particularly for migrants that from Italy were sent back to Libya. This tendency developed an inaccurate screening of these migrants from Italian authorities and no proper identification of trafficking victims. As it was observed by the European Court of Human Rights, in February 2012, this policy led to an important violation of migrant's rights to ask for asylums seek or other forms of help (Department of States, 2012).

### **3.3. Research Design**

The whole study is based on the central research question, established at the beginning. Developing a study design means establishing a research question that will be central during the whole research process. The research question will be, absolutely, decisive during the investigation process. The main question should be formulated clearly and explicitly, it does not have to be vague but narrowed and focused. The question establishes the line of investigations; it leads to the choice of certain methods and helps to

tackle the problem from a specific angle. Especially, when the social phenomenon is too broad as human trafficking, and a lot of research has already been conducted it facilitates focusing on a particular perspective. When the research question is too broad, the risk is to lose track and the guidance function declines automatically. The most important thing is the questions should be formulated in such a way that they are capable of being answered. In the case of this research the main research question, as already mentioned in the first part, is:

*What barriers or challenges do local law enforcement and victim's service providers face in collaborating in responding to a trafficking case?*

In accordance to my research question, I decided to conduct interviews as it will be explained in the next paragraph.

### **3.3.1. Methods of data collection**

This study will incorporate the analysis of these two countries: Italy and the Netherlands. So, the current research will be a comparative cross national study and will analyze the differences and similarities, in regard to the same field, in two different countries. In comparative studies problems will be observed in a multiplicity way, the aim is to understand cultural differences, why there are certain differences and what is the historical process that leads to such a diverse reality. In our case, the research will focus on two different professions; we will observe the different ways of approaching the same problem. At the end the design of the study will be comparative, cross national but also qualitative. Qualitative methods, applied in social research are characterized by no single method, but a range of different methods as part of different approaches that may be selected in accordance to the main research question. In social sciences, when research is

based on the use of qualitative methods, the object of investigation and the central question represent the point of reference for the selection and evaluation of methods. The use of qualitative methods is strongly recommended when everyday's life events have to be investigated: data are collected in their natural context and statements are analyzed in the context of an extended answer or a narrative, or the total course of an interview. The capability of researchers to catch certain features during the whole investigation process plays a decisive role. Actions and observations in the field of investigation is an essential part of the discovery process. According to different researchers, qualitative research develops a subjective construction of reality of those under investigation and creates the conditions to discover different angles of social phenomenon (Flick et al., 2004). Field research, participation and observation are fundamental methods when we decide to investigate a phenomenon. Due to the lack of time, in this particular research, data collection has been developed through interviews, and just with social service providers and police officers. Also resources should be properly evaluated during the research design process. According to my time table I started contacting the professionals, I intended to interview, in April/May 2012. My availability had to be compatible with the one of my informants; in fact an advanced period of time had been considered. Different professionals were contacted, at the end the number of interviews obtained were seven. In the Netherlands I interviewed two service providers and two police officers, while in Italy two service providers and one police officer. The interviews developed in different ways, some were developed personally, some through telephone call and some through e-mail. The different ways were determined by several factors dependent on my availabilities and on the one of the informants. The interviews which were personally and telephonically conducted were recorded and later on transcript on paper to analyze

them properly. The one through e-mail were analyzed once they were obtained and the informants gave their availability to be contacted a second time for any need of clarification. The questions were equal in both countries. The whole interview was composed by 22<sup>7</sup> questions strictly related to cooperation dynamics between different stakeholders. The questions were asked in Italian language in Italy and in English and some parts in Dutch, in the Netherlands. The whole interview was anticipated by a former personal presentation, where I described the intention and the aim of my work. The research question has been made explicit, so that the objective of the research was clear since the beginning. I asked my interlocutor if it was possible to record the whole interview and I explained the reasons why I intended to use a recorder. I expressed my thankfulness for their collaboration and time; I told them I was particularly interested in their professional experience and point of views in regard to their field of work. At the end I showed my availability to answer any curiosity question they, eventually, had towards me. The interview was composed by open questions; the questions were pre-formulated in order work as guidelines during the whole interview. The interviews I conducted can be categorized in the focused interviews group, where you mainly focus on a subject or topic of conversation determined in advance, with a relatively open form (Flick et al., 2004). In fact, during the interview I gave plenty of freedom of movement, where the informants had the possibility to answer broadly but without losing track. My aim was to obtain depth, valid and detailed answers. In order to obtain that, the questions were formulated in a way to get nuanced answers and, in some cases, to avoid yes or no answers I asked interviewee to add some reasons and motivations or I relied with some fellow up questions. The first part of the interview was composed by general,

---

<sup>7</sup> Consult Annex 1 for further details.

easy questions in order to create an empathy and less formal atmosphere, mainly about their personal professional life. Afterwards, central questions were demanded, to focus more on the central topic. The questions were concentrating on cooperation dynamics in relation to their professional mandate and professional experience. In case of curiosity, or need for further details I added more spontaneous questions during the interview process or just asked for explanations. In the conclusion phase, I asked for particular recommendations or suggestions for the future. I thanked again for their time and cooperation, and asked for permission in case of reporting their names on the research. I added also the possibility to receive a copy of the research once it would have been concluded.

### **3.3.2. Interviews in Italy**

I started looking through the internet who could have been the most suitable interview partners. In Italy, in regard to social service providers, I got to know Claudio Donadel, who wanted to cooperate on my research. He gave his consent to be interviewed by e-mail in accordance to his work commitments, and he sent me back the e-mail as soon as he was finished answering the questions. The same happened for Giuseppina Di Bari, a colleague of Claudio Donadel, who is also working for the Municipality of Venice. Regarding police officers, I contacted through e-mail, and later on by telephone, Sostituto Commissario Gianfranco Guarnieri from the Questura of Venice. Claudio Donadel already mentioned me, by e-mail, about the strong cooperation between the Municipality and the Questura of Venice in approaching cases of human trafficking and also recommended me to contact Sostituto Commissario Gianfranco Guarnieri. Regarding Police, the procedure, compared to social service providers, was less simple. I had to respect a particular procedure where I had to ask for a special permission to the

Questore of Venice to be able to conduct my interviews. Obtained the required permission I contacted Sostituto Commissario Gianfranco Guarnieri and I performed the interview through a telephone call. Unfortunately, there were no other colleagues available to be interviewed so I just obtained the possibility to develop one interview.

### **3.3.3. Interviews in the Netherlands**

The police officer Floor Jansen of the Investigations department in Amsterdam helped me to conduct my planned interviews with both social service providers and police officers. I contacted Floor Jansen through other professions from the Police I got to know while I was writing my bachelor thesis in Italy and they helped me to find proper informants for my current research. Regarding the Police officers in the Netherlands the procedure was less formal; they did not require any particular permission and gave their immediate availability to be interviewed. During those days, completely unexpected, they asked me to join the team in their regular controls around the red light district area in Amsterdam and I accepted their offer enthusiastically! The first interview with the police officer, Raymond Venema, took place in his office Bureau Beursstraat in Amsterdam. The second interviewee, Caroline Loeber, because of an urgent family problem, was only available to answer my question electronically by e-mail. So, she sent me all the answers after completing the whole interview. In regard to social providers I interviewed two social workers, Lianne Belt and Murielle Payet, of the association SHOP in Den Haag. The interview took place one day with both professions in their office, during a regular working day.

### **3.4. Ethical considerations**

Scientific papers, as the present research, have to take into account certain Ethical considerations while conducting social science research (Homan, 1991). Ethical values are closely connected to moral and political beliefs that every person has built during their life time. When you start being a researcher you have to be aware on the way you collect, analyse and interpret data, it will be essential trying to be as objectively as possible and vigilant against the influence of your personal beliefs and preferences. First of all, it is important to be honest and transparent during the whole process of the research. Since the beginning the researcher has to inform the informants about the intentions: what will be the research about, why it will be developed, what will be the aim of the research etc. In other words the informants should be made aware about the purpose and the use of the data that will be collected during the interview (British Sociological Association quoted in Gomm, 2008).

Secondly, the researcher needs to have the agreement from the informants. According to Wisker during the whole research process the researcher should be aware of the potential of producing a written piece of paper. The risk of bringing out physical or psychological harm should be taken into consideration. That is why it is important to have informants' consent before writing sensitive information. As social researcher it is constantly required to keep in mind that your subject of study is human beings and they are considered as participants who cooperate in the development of the research. Without the informant's knowledge or experience your final research would have a complete different aspect. However the research should always respect the principle of confidentiality when requested (Wisker, 2008). In regard to this particular research all



the informants were accurately informed about the intent of the work and why their contribution was essential in order to develop it. It was explicitly asked to all of them if their names could have been mentioned on the research or if they preferred to be reported anonymously. However, all the informants agreed on being named on the research. All interviews conducted personally have been recorded after asking former permission.

## 4. PART FOUR ANALYSES

The cooperation dynamics between law enforcement officers and social providers is strongly recommended in terms of prevention, identification and provision of assistance to victims of human trafficking and prosecution of traffickers as well as in the preparation and implementation of potential returns to, and reintegration in, their countries of origin (UN.GIFT & OIM, 2009). This chapter intends to report, the answer to the main research question through the analysis of the collected data in the two different countries: Italy and the Netherlands. In regard to the empirical part of this research, as mentioned in chapter three, different interviews in both countries were conducted. The asked questions were articulated in three main categories:

- 1- “Individual profiles”: general questions to know about the person, how long he/she is working for this service, why he/she is working for this service, what was his/her previous job and what he/she is expected to do in accordance to his/her professional mandatory.
- 2- “Cooperation”: Questions related to the main research question in regard to cooperation.
- 3- “Professional conflicts”: Questions related to mutual working understanding.

So in this first part we will have a profile description of the informants involved to carry out this research, afterwards we will report what are the outcomes of the interviews in both countries.

## **4.1. Analysis of the interviews in the Netherlands**

### **4.1.1. Dutch informants' profile**

In the Netherlands four interviews were conducted with two police officers, Reymond Venema and Caroline Loeber and two social workers from the organization SHOP, Lianne Belt and Murielle Payet. All the interviews were performed in their offices apart from the one with Caroline Loeber, conducted by e-mail due to personal problems. The interview with the social workers took place with both of them at the same time.

### **4.1.2. Police officers**

### **4.1.3. Caroline Loeber**

Caroline Loeber is working for the police for about fifteen years, eight for the DNR and three for FIET mensenhandel en mensensmokkel where the tasks are, monitoring current investigations and obtaining an overview in addition to finding opportunities for new investigations. While she was working as a normal police officer in uniform she crossed different human trafficking cases that leaded her to raise her interest towards Human Rights. She started her Police carrier as police officer in uniform; afterwards she worked for five years in a regional team dealing with prostitution issues, human trafficking and child pornography. Later on she ended up doing her current job. As a human trafficking expert, according to her professional mandatory her functions are advisory role, research and provide trainings to professionals working in the field.

#### **4.1.4. Reymond Venema**

Reymond Venema is working in Amsterdam as police officer for twelve years and since ten in the prostitution field. The office he is working for is located in the center of Amsterdam and they are working on prevention and assistance to victims of human trafficking. What he is expected to do in accordance to his professional mandatory, is to go around the red light district and check on the girls who are working as prostitutes. He always works with a team of two professions, mainly he has to check documents, legal status in case of foreign girls and tries to identify if the girls are there voluntarily or there is someone behind forcing them. As far as he comes into contact with a victim of human trafficking or in general with something suspicious he has to report it on paper. After the file is completed he sends it to research experts who, once there is enough material, will carry out a police investigation.

#### **4.1.5. Social Service providers**

In regard to Lianne Belt and Murielle Payet, they are both working for SHOP located in the center of Den Haag. SHOP is the regional center of experts in the field of assistance and services to prostitutes and victims of human trafficking. SHOP helps (ex) prostitutes and trafficking victims by providing information, advice, practical and psychosocial support. They also provide accommodation like, shelters for homeless prostitutes, drugs addicted prostitutes and shelters for victims of human trafficking. The organization conducts regular research on prostitution, human trafficking and other related topics. The office where the interview took place was composed by social

workers, and it is a general information center for people who work in prostitution voluntarily and people who are forced to work in the sex industry. They provide information regarding taxes procedures; they offer a legal counseling once a week and regular social counseling. They support national and international victims of human trafficking. In fact Murielle Payet works mainly with national and Lianne Belt with international victims. The organization works also on a preventive level by distributing flyers in the red light district or clubs of Den Haag.

#### **4.1.6. Murielle Payet**

Murielle Payet is working for SHOP for about five years, first she was working for a women shelter. She describes that national victims of human trafficking, most of the times, come voluntarily to the service, or call the organization. Mainly, victims got to know about the organization due to preventive information received in clubs or in crucial areas of the city, from a friend or the police. After the first orientation interview they establish an appointment and start building their trust and develop a social independency project.

#### **4.1.7. Lianne Belt**

Lianne Belt is working for SHOP for about three years, before she was working for the refugee council and that is how she got to know the organization she is currently working. Lianne Belt works mainly with international victims and, because of the illegal status of victims, her work, apart from assisting and supporting them, involves a stronger cooperation with the IND.

#### **4.1.8. Professional's approach to cooperation**

The interviews show that for both professions cooperation represent a central aspect in order to develop an appropriate support to victims. In regard to police officers, Caroline Loeber states that cooperation plays a key role in relation to her professional mandatory, it helps to support and complete each others work in order to provide victims with a comprehensive approach enhance your knowledge and become more open to new ideas and improvements. She underlines these aspects saying that without cooperation it would not be possible for her to conduct her work. She continuous saying that cooperation is crucial when we think about data exchange, sharing information and ways of working, somehow it compensates each other. She says that there is a cooperative approach from both sides even though every organization has its own aim and its own professional mandate. She tends to think that cooperation is mostly needed during the first phase of victim's protection procedure due to the problematic and delicate phase. She adds that with her regular contacts, during the evaluation of a case there is a concrete cooperation attitude. In fact she also believes that multidisciplinary trainings represent a way to facilitate and promote cooperation, it represents a common platform where to learn from each other about professional limitations and possibilities but also to simply know each other and keep in touch. Also cooperation agreements represent the right basis to build proper cooperation dynamics, because they make clear which are the tasks of each profession and promote a homogenous way of tackling the issue. From her point of view, the overall aim of professions involved is different but at the same time victim's needs are from both considered as central. Also because, in the years, the need to cooperate while tackling human trafficking cases has become more

and more evident. Raymond Venema, during his interview, argues that cooperation has to be included in his daily work and if someone is missing automatically there is a gap, a link missing. For him cooperation means openness towards other professions and honesty by providing right information. He believes that collecting all different information together helps providing a stronger answer to victim's needs. As Caroline Loeber, he also mentions about cooperating in the interest of the victim, he underlines that everything has to be done following the common scope of victim's safety and protection of her/his psychological and physical health. He talks about good cooperation due to professional's flexibility in order to reach same results. Lianne Belt, social worker, when I asked her about how much cooperation should be included in her work she replies, a lot. She underlines the importance of having fixed contact persons where you can lay on who are aware about what you are doing. She thinks that interdisciplinary courses are essential to enhance cooperation, but also to personally know the other professions. Also cooperation protocols are recognized as being very effective, so that everybody knows about other stakeholders' work involved. She adds that it facilitates working together in order to reach the best outcomes for clients. She tends to think that cooperation is required and important in every phase of victim's protection procedure and during the evaluation of the case, she states, there is a cooperative approach from both sides. Murielle Payet, second social worker interviewed during my stay in the Netherlands, agrees on the great value of cooperation in fighting human trafficking. She thinks her organization, could not work without because sharing information is crucial to work more properly. She also mentions about having fixed contact persons, in order to build a stable working relationship that will facilitate the procedures. In fact she adds that multiagency trainings help to establish contacts with

different stakeholder so that you can later on working more easily together. She identifies the beginning, of victim's protection procedure, as requiring more stable cooperation dynamics, because the most delicate and sensitive phase. She thinks that the attitude to be cooperative is very present in their case, because everybody is very flexible.

#### **4.1.9. Organization of the established cooperation**

In order to improve cooperation between different stakeholders' different interdisciplinary trainings are organized and Caroline Loeber explains which kind the police in the Netherlands conducts or participates to:

- Different times a year the police offers trainings to external partners in regard to:
  - 1- Criminal law and human trafficking indicators;
  - 2- Where and how to report, when during their daily life job, they cross a human trafficking case;
  - 3- Their role in case of supporting evidence.
- Twice a year social service providers or police organize interdisciplinary congresses where experiences are shared and knowledge about international developments will be divulged.
- Once or twice a year international interdisciplinary trainings and educational courses are conducted. For example recently the Dutch police together with social service providers and lawyers has given some lectures about Romanian victims of human trafficking to Romanian prosecutors and lawyers.



But also she explains about different cooperation protocols they have/signed between the partners. They have regional or local, even if informal or on a voluntary basis they are supposed to share information talk about cases and victim's identification. Then they have specific research assignments, where practically it is discussed how to persecute traffickers and in advance it is formalized what the different partners are supposed to do together. As last one, they have a national agreement where they regularly discuss about legislation and implementation actions, human trafficking indicators and code of conducts. This agreement is evaluated by the BNRM and Korpsmonitor. The same for social workers which have local interdisciplinary meetings every six weeks to discuss about common cases. And also national trainings organized by CoMensha and Fairwork. SHOP signed in 2006, together with other partners, a regional cooperation protocol with the police called: Protocol Netwerk Mensenhandel Regio Den Haag which will be soon revised and substituted with a new one.

#### **4.1.10. Weaknesses and contrasts**

Even though cooperation represents a fundamental tool for professionals who are working in the fight against human trafficking there are still some challenges that need to be tackled. From Caroline Loeber's professional experience she says that not always, during multidisciplinary trainings, communication goes fluently as it should be. She refers mainly to certain organizations which are strongly linked to privacy regulations and it could represent an obstacle while you try to work together. She also mentions about cooperation agreements which on one hand help to define more clearly which are the roles of the stakeholders involved, but on the other hand sometimes it can be problematic when different opinions rise up for possible implementations. Caroline

Loeber, also says that social service providers not always, even though most of the times, cooperate in establishing a trustful relationship between professions. There have been cases, where it ended up into a professional conflict because of different interests. The aims are somehow different, she says; social service providers aim to protect victims and police officers fight against the crime, even if their work is very close and linked. She adds that if cooperation is not managed in a proper way it can have some consequences on victims and their trust into institutions. At the end there is not always a mutual trust, she argues that there are still cases where the police, because of negative experiences of the past, prefers not to work anymore with certain organizations. But it is important to underline that it depends from single organizations, with some there is a total mutual trust. Raymond Venema, adds that sometimes organizations are not in harmony between each other, so it can slow down the cooperation process. He also mentions that cooperation can be weaker in certain holiday's periods in case there is a lack of professionals working, it can create an obstacle in daily work. Confirmed also by social workers, is the lack of shelters which can be very frustrating while you are dealing with a case; it, somehow, contributes making it harder to build a trustful relationship with victims. He explains about certain difficulties in relation to foreign victims, often you need to make a bigger effort to earn their trust because it is common in their origin countries that police is corrupted and is not there to help them. Sometimes it can be hard to explain victims that the Dutch system works differently and the gap of communication, due to the lack of language skills contributes in making their work harder. In regard to international victims, Lianne Belt, confirms what Raymond Venema mentions during his interview. And she makes a criticism in regard to that. She points out that, with international victims you have to work more closely with the

police, and sometimes she does not agree on the way how they treat them. She mentions about different ways of treating international from national victims. She notices that sometimes they do not make any effort to reduce communication gaps, and treat victims without proper respect. She explains, through examples that, in these cases, when she assists victims she tries to build strategies and reformulate questions previously asked by police officers. She tries to explain in a different way so that the victim understands and is able to answer. On the other hand she justifies it, saying that the raising amount of cases, the need of concrete facts and the lack of time do not facilitate a proper way of working. Also, Murielle Payet, even if her overall view about cooperation dynamics is predominantly positive, thinks that the lack of time can somehow create an obstacle.

## **4.2. Analysis of the interviews in Italy**

### **4.2.1. Italian informants' profile**

In Italy, three interviews were conducted. The informants were two social service providers, Claudio Donadel and Giuseppina Di Bari and one police officer Gianfranco Guarnieri. Due to organizational problems the interviews took place through e-mail and through telephone call.

### **4.2.2. Social Service providers**

#### **4.2.3. Claudio Donadel**

Claudio Donadel is a social educator working for the Municipality of Venice since 1995. Before working with victims of human trafficking he was working as a street and

community educator dealing with youth problems. Its professional mandate is articulated on different levels: local, regional and national. Locally, Claudio Donadel, organizes and coordinates all actions in regard to prostitution. He works by preventing the phenomenon, monitoring local situations, providing health prevention and mediate with victims who want to escape exploitation systems while reducing potential conflicts. He also assists victims who decide to undertake protection paths by assisting them directly or providing them with ad hoc assistance, work on social inclusion and help them in case of return in their countries´ of origin. On a regional level, he tries to enhance contacts with different stakeholders in the whole region, to improve multiagency work and to confirm a human-rights based approach. Claudio Donadel as representative of ANCI, on a National level, takes part of the Inter-ministerial commission that supports victims of human trafficking by controlling and planning government's funds aimed to finance Article 18 and Article 13 projects. From an operational point of view, all interventions are addressed to women and children victims of human trafficking or are awareness raising and sensitization initiatives targeting local communities. The main activities of the organization, Claudio Donadel, is working for are ramified in three:

- Identification of victims of trafficking or people involved in exploitation dynamics
- Protection, assistance and integration of victims
- And, legal assistance who acts as witnesses.

Within the territory of the Municipality of Venice, each victim who is in need and wants to undertake a protection/integration path can be accommodated in: protected communities, accommodation groups of mutual assistance and host families. The

Municipality of Venice driven by the need to cooperate with law enforcement established two specialized operative units, one composed by professionals from the social services and the other of law enforcement authorities, with the aim to protect and assist victims of trafficking. So, the organization provides a specialized operative unit, “Street Operators Team, which is composed by five trainers and four female linguistic mediators from Romania, Nigeria, Russia and Albania, established within the Servizio Adulti dell’Assessorato alle Politiche Sociali. According to the mandate, the unit is active 24 hours a day, 365 days a year; they work on their own initiative or operate on relevant information received from other institutions or citizens.

#### **4.2.4. Giuseppina Di Bari**

Giuseppina Di Bari, is also working for the Municipality of Venice as a social educator since 2002. On the basis of a human rights and multidisciplinary approach, she coordinates; article 18 projects and programs of assistance and social integration for victims. They work on preventive measures, provide a safe environment to victims, legal and psychological assistance, cultural mediators, and guarantee access to long and short term assistance.

#### **4.2.5. Police office**

#### **4.2.6. Gianfranco Guarnieri**

In regard to Police officers Sostituto Commissario Gianfranco Guarnieri of State Police in accordance to our commitments was interviewed through telephone. Gianfranco Guarnieri, is working for the Venice’s Questura since 1997. His office provides a street

unit of the Seconda Sezione della Squadra mobile, composed by law enforcement officers who are part of the Venice police. As the unit provided by the social service providers, it is active 24 hours a day, 365 days a year and operates on their own initiative or on the basis of other institutions or citizens' reports. Mainly, he and his team have the first contact with victims of human trafficking, to orient them or to collect statements; they make all the investigations and they refer the case to the court authorities.

#### **4.2.7. Professional's approach to cooperation**

As the Dutch case, interviews show that cooperation between stakeholders is crucial in the fight against human trafficking. Claudio Donadel describes cooperation in relation to his professional mandate as one of the principle methodologies used to conduct his work. From his professional point of view cooperation is a working tool which proves that the system of interventions leads to a real strategy that combats trafficking in human being, works against crime and is based on a human rights approach. He states that a multi agency approach is necessary during the whole process of assistance: from identification until social inclusion and independency. It is crucial to have a stable network with all stakeholders, health services, psychologists, shelters, employment offices, lawyers, judiciary and law enforcement: law enforcement who deal with investigations and research and, the one, who deal with administrative issues like, residence permits. He claims that cooperation is more efficient, and should continue to be like that, particularly during the identification phase of a victim. Also during this phase, a victim-centered approach is adopted facilitating law enforcement's investigations and penal procedure to convict the traffickers. As a result, conviction of traffickers helps victims'

social inclusion and the transition from being a victim to a citizen. His colleague, Giuseppina Di Bari, confirms saying that a multi agency approach is indispensable in order to respond towards different victims' needs. She thinks that cooperation facilitates the development of standard assistance measures on a local, national and international level which help to guarantee quality services. She states that on a local level in Venice cooperation is fluidly managed while respecting each mission and professionalism. She identifies as the most delicate phase identification where victims need a holistic answer to their demands. And it is particularly in this phase that cooperation is mostly confirmed by years of experience. Even though, Giuseppina Di Bari adds, it is important to maintain a regular update between professions. And also provide accurate assistance to victims who decide to go to court. She states that maintenance of a stable net work should be guaranteed through a constant information exchange and multidisciplinary trainings in order enhance mutual trust. Particularly she says that in the last years, because of constant changes regarding the phenomenon, cooperation has become more strong on an internal and external level, because clearly recognized as effective. From the police officer perspective, Gianfranco Guarnieri, argues that in accordance to his professional mandatory he is expected to fully cooperate with social service providers. He defines cooperation as being the basis of his work during investigations, but also during re integration of victims into society. It is essential and without it would have been almost impossible to conduct daily work. In fact he says that in every single case, when they have an interview with a victim of human trafficking they are suppose to include cultural and linguistic mediators provided by social service providers. He adds that this facilitates interviews because victims seem to be more comfortable while she/he is talking with someone who is totally aware about cultural,

traditional, and language differences. It also helps police officers to give a deeper meaning to what victims are reporting. It also contributes reducing potential obstacles and facilitates the establishment of a trustful relationship. He has regular contact, almost every week, with social service providers to tackle together problems they cross during daily work. He emphasizes their cooperation, mentioning their fluent information exchange which is fundamental to evaluate together different situations. He confirms they work synergistically together due to an absolute positive approach from both sides. He says, in every single case, cooperation works very well from identification until penal procedure. He assists victims during the whole procedure until the penal procedure ends, until traffickers are convicted. Apart cases when victims need to be repatriate where competences are due to social service providers together with IOM. However, even in those cases they previously discuss together about it.

#### **4.2.8. Organization of the established cooperation**

The tools which enhance cooperation are interdisciplinary trainings and cooperation protocols signed by both entities. In regard to interdisciplinary trainings, Claudio Donadel and Giuseppina Di Bari argue that every year an educational needs assessment takes place. Afterwards three educational programs are carried out:

- 1- A formative course/work shop for public and Ngos professionals who work with victims of human trafficking in the whole Veneto region is carried out. During these courses they try to enhance the net work between the different stakeholders, share the common general and specific objectives, detect strengths and weaknesses of the intervention system and identify and share models of



good practice. The trainers are external experts whose role is to facilitate the dynamics inside the group and come up with themes of discussion and important inputs.

- 2- Formative ad hoc courses for social service providers, law enforcement and judiciary within the activities expected by a multiagency approach. Where the main aim is to create a common “language” and codify practices and procedures for example during the identification phase, protection of victims, preventive measures, regularizations, protection and support during the penal procedure etc. These courses are supported by a formal agreement with the research and service center for human rights of the University of Padova, and is spread all over the region.
- 3- A transvers educational course designed for all stakeholders to discuss about the evolution of the phenomenon, national and international laws about protection of human rights and immigration and specific methodologies adopted to tackle the problem. This course is articulated in different formative modules trained by external and internal experts, or experts with whom a formal cooperation is established for example the research and service center for human rights of the University of Padova.

In regard to cooperation protocols law enforcement and social service providers work together through different projects of article 18 and article 13 agreed together. The Municipality of Venice and the local Law enforcement office, as already mentioned, established two operative units one provided by social service providers and one by the law enforcement, for the protection and assistance of victims of human trafficking. The two units, in accordance to their mandate, mainly cooperate on different fronts:

- Monitoring the local area together;
- Planning actions as partners;
- Trainings on a regularly basis, in order to improve procedures and interventions in the field.

#### **4.2.9. Weaknesses and contrasts**

Claudio Donadel, also confirmed by Giuseppina Di Bari, identifies these multi disciplinary courses as the right platform where to share information between professions because of its importance in developing right cooperation dynamics. But, on the other hand his criticism, in agreement with Gianfranco Guarnieri, goes towards lack of specific funding. As a consequence, as an alternative, they have to subtract relevant resources allocated for victim's interventions in order to actualize these courses. Some critics refer also to cooperation agreements which are sometimes established on a political level without suiting to reality. Gianfranco Guarnieri also mentions about cooperation issues at the beginning of their work, in 1996-1997 when the phenomenon of human trafficking was quit recent and there was not such a valid information exchange as today. Claudio Donadel links risks and potential risks between professions to identification phase of victims, because of the different approaches. He makes a distinction and defines "the police approach" and "human rights based approach". The "police approach" is based on the strong connection between victim's report and assistance. While, "human rights based approach" victim's assistance goes independently from the report. So, the first one is reward while the second one is based on human rights. During the identification and first assistance phase, the "police approach" is using the "human rights based approach", conducted by social service

providers, in order to obtain a witness from victims, and this can sometimes create conflicts. In other words law enforcement authorities can benefit from the trusting relationship established between social service providers and victims. He adds that there is no overlapping between care and control; the roles are clearly distinguished in terms of no control; he talks about social control because of victim's central position. According to Giuseppina Di Bari, sometimes, information exchange can be reduced due to professional limits (respect for privacy or investigations). In these cases is important to maintain a distinction between the professions but at the same time be complementary. In regard to conflicts between professions, she adds that, historically, social professions emphasize more protection, and respect for human rights while, sometimes, law enforcements focus more on investigations and victim's report and neglect victim's weaknesses.

### **4.3. Comparative analysis between the two countries**

#### **4.3.1. Commons**

From both countries, and both professions cooperation is perceived as a common value and as something essentially incorporated while conducting their work. We can observe that from both sides the identification phase is perceived as the one which needs a more stable cooperation structure. In both countries police recognizes the need of social service providers in order to facilitate dialogues with victims who are traumatized and have difficulties in expressing them self. The police, as a consequence of victim's cultural gap, have to conduct a double effort in order to achieve victim's trust, and in both countries police officers think that for social providers it is easier to develop a

trustful relationship, one of the reasons why they compensate each other. Both professions in both countries recognize the importance of having regular contacts which help managing cases more quickly and most of the times they are informally arranged. What also emerged is the common attitude of being flexible and somehow able to adapt your self to different and sometimes unexpected situations. A common issue is identified in the lack of funds which can create a concrete obstacle while working together and in general to reach professional and institutional aims. For example in the Netherlands, there is a lack of shelters, while in Italy general cuts in social field are active since years. From the conducted interviews it results that all parties involved seem to be open to the point's of view of the other professionals, flexible in their way of thinking, and willing to try new didactic methods and learning experiences. In both countries they recommend having a larger amount of founding to develop more common trainings and codify standardized good practice models. Lastly, decision makers should more focus on needs expressed by professionals working in the field in order to provide proper measures and tools against trafficking in human beings.

#### **4.3.2. Differences**

In the Netherlands cooperation agreements are for social workers and police officers, interpreted as a good tool to clarify roles, which is not mentioned at all by professionals in Italy. This can give some space of interpretation concerning a potential professional overlapping. During my stay in the Netherlands, the police offered me to join the team in their regular controls around the red light district area in Amsterdam and I had the possibility to, one evening, directly observe what their duties are and how they normally conduct their job. The way how police officers were approaching the girls working in

the red light district was particularly attentive. The whole conversation was in English; they asked girls for their documents and explained them carefully how it works in the Netherlands if you are working as a prostitute. They underlined that the job is supposed to be practiced on a voluntary basis and the money you earn has to be yours. They also asked the girls about the address they were working, so that in case of emergency they would have been able to tell the police exactly where they were. In case the girl did not know the exact name, the police officer helped her to memorize the name and explained the importance about having this information clear in mind. The Netherlands, differently from Italy, provides a National Rapporteur about human trafficking relevant to coordinate national action plans, promote cooperation and enhance national policy and procedures while in Italy an entity like BNRM is missing. In Italy even though, the assistance process is perceived as a European model there is still missing a proper National Referral system.

#### **4.3.3. Conclusion**

Findings show that cooperation between social service providers and law enforcements has been identified in the years as particularly fundamental in the fight against human trafficking. It confirms the theory supported by many experts of having a national Memorandum of Understanding where every thing is clearly defined and regularly assessed to create a stable cooperation structure (UN.GIFT & OIM, 2009). The evident need of a comprehensive approach has brought to discussion different entities and states. In fact in accordance to OSCE's Action Plan to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings at a national level, National Referral Mechanism should be established and created ad hoc to every single state which is involved in the trafficking of human beings. The overall aim should be of victims' human rights protection with the

establishment of appropriate services where a range of different specialized services are addressing the specific needs of each individual victim (OSCE, 2004). As a result it is important to preserve a constant dialogue between different stakeholders, and enhance regular multi disciplinary trainings and regular meetings; these could represent the right tools to reach common objectives. In fact, as confirmed also by our informants, they represent the right method to support this dialogue and enhance cooperation. The different professions with their professional mandates compensate each other and a harmonious way of working together will help centralizing the victim's position and at the same time combat the crime. Still some problems exist, for example the overall European tendency to apply stricter laws to combat irregular migration can be detrimental towards stable cooperation dynamics between law enforcement and social providers. As a consequence victims of human trafficking are not recognized as such and may not receive proper assistance rather they have to be deported back to their countries of origin. This research shows that in Italy and the Netherlands there is no domination from the individual entities in the interventions. They consciously integrate their modalities of working, because they mutually recognize their needs and at the same time try to achieve their own specific objectives. At the end cooperation is established in both countries, and professionals act recognizing best interests of victims within the law limits and face their challenges properly with flexibility and recognition.

#### **4.4. Recommendations**

What would be particularly interesting, in this context, is investigating on victim's point of view, what is their perception towards different professional's approach. They are mostly involved and affected by disharmonious cooperation's dynamics or by different professional's approaches. They can have a complete different perception, and change the view of the research. On the other hand, due to the critical field of study and lack of time, access this target group would have been particularly difficult. But still it can stay open and be explored as a next study angle. According to the complexity of the phenomenon recommendations should cover different spheres and this research can only be regarded as a small step forward emphasizing need to invest more funding in cooperation and combat comprehensively human trafficking. Since many years it is assumed that a comprehensive respond is necessary to protect victims and combat the crime. On a national level, governments should facilitate and invest more in order to enhance cooperation on a national and local level. National anti-trafficking plans, on yearly bases, that support joint trainings between social providers and police officers should be developed to concretely know each other. But also, because of constant changes regarding the phenomenon it is crucial to develop common updated tools to properly combat it. Once we nationally will reach a stable, standardized way of cooperating it will be important to enlarge cooperation dynamics on an international level. In fact, what is strongly recommended, in accordance also to Holmes, is a European Multi-Agency Experts Working Group. The topic taken into analysis is an international crime, which involves different countries, and the establishment of such a group will facilitate the creation of a homogeneous European way of tackling the

problem and being more effective together (Holmes, 2002). Such a multi agency group can be interpreted as a tool to share models of good practice between countries and stakeholders. The main purpose will be to create a strong common answer to the issue that will help to find the right way to combat it. Establishing a Multi-Agency Experts Working Group will represent the right platform where to share information, develop common research and work on equal protective and penal measures.



## **Bibliography**

**Adams, K. et al. (2008)** Trafficking in Women in Germany. Berlin: Bundesweiter Koordinierungskreis gegen Frauenhandel und Gewalt an Frauen im Migrationsprozess e.V.

**Anti-Slavery International (2002)** Human Traffic, Human Rights: redefining victim protection, [pdf] Available at:  
[http://www.antislavery.org/includes/documents/cm\\_docs/2009/h/hum\\_traff\\_hum\\_rights\\_red\\_ef\\_vic\\_protec\\_final\\_full.pdf](http://www.antislavery.org/includes/documents/cm_docs/2009/h/hum_traff_hum_rights_red_ef_vic_protec_final_full.pdf) [Accessed October 26, 2011].

**Armitage, P., Berry, G. & Matthews, J.N.S. (2002)** Statistical methods in medical research, Wiley Online Library. Available at:  
<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9780470773666.fmatter/summary> [Accessed July 8, 2012].

**Aronowitz, A.A. (2001)** Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: the phenomenon, the markets that drive it and the organisations that promote it. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 9(2), pp.163–195.

**Avdan, N. (2011)** Human Trafficking, Organized Crime, and Border Control: Vicious or Virtuous Cycle?, working paper, Available at:  
[http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=1900501](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1900501) [Accessed October 27, 2011].

**Baldoni, E. (2007)** Racconti di trafficking : una ricerca sulla tratta delle donne straniere a scopo di sfruttamento sessuale, Milano: FrancoAngeli.

**Bell, J. (2005)** Doing your research project: a guide for first-time researchers in education, health and social science. 4th ed. Berkshire: Open University Press.

**Bharos A. (2009)** Dutch policy on human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, working paper, Department of The Hague School of European Studies, Haagse Hogeschool: Den Haag.

**Bilger, V., et al. (2010)** Study on the assessment of the extent of different types of Trafficking in Human Beings in EU countries, ICMPD.

**BMFSFJ, Bund-Länder-Arbeitsgruppe Frauenhandel (2007)** Kooperationskonzept für die Zusammenarbeit von Fachberatungsstellen und Polizei für den Schutz von Opferzeugen/innen von Menschenhandel zum Zweck der sexuellen Ausbeutung.

**BM.I & IOM (2005)** Resource book for law enforcement officers on good practices in combating child trafficking. Available at:  
[http://www.ch.iom.int/fileadmin/media/pdf/publikationen/resource\\_book.pdf](http://www.ch.iom.int/fileadmin/media/pdf/publikationen/resource_book.pdf) [Accessed June 12, 2012].

**BNRM (2003)** Second report of the Dutch National Rapporteur, The Hague: BNRM.

**BNRM (2007)** Fifth report of the Dutch National Rapporteur, The Hague: BNRM.

**BNRM (2010)** Human Trafficking – ten years of independent monitoring. The Hague: BNRM.

**Brussa, L. (2009)** European mapping report [pdf] Amsterdam: TAMPEP International Foundation. Available at:

<http://tampep.eu/documents/TAMPEP%202009%20European%20Mapping%20Report.pdf>

[Accessed 14 October 2011].

**Bufo, M., Orfano, I. (2003)** The Italian system of assistance and integration of victims of trafficking in human beings. Italy: On the Road.

**Carchedi, F. (2010)** La tratta delle minorenni nigeriane in Italia. Idati, i racconti, i servizi sociali. [online] Rome: Associazione Parsec, Ministero degli affari esteri and UNICRI.

Available at:

[http://www.unicri.it/emerging\\_crimes/human\\_trafficking/nigeria2/docs/TrattaMinorenniNigeriaItalia\\_IT.pdf](http://www.unicri.it/emerging_crimes/human_trafficking/nigeria2/docs/TrattaMinorenniNigeriaItalia_IT.pdf) [Accessed 10 October 2011].

**Carchedi, F., Bernardotti, A. and Ferone, B. (2005)** Schiavitù emergenti: la tratta e lo sfruttamento delle donne nigeriane sul litorale Domitio. Rome: Ediesse.

**Carchedi, F., Stridbeck, U. and Tola, V. (2007)** Lo Zoning possibile: Governance della prostituzione e della tratta di donne. Il caso di Venezia, Stoccolma e Amsterdam. Milan: Franco Angeli.

**Cartabia, M., Lamarque, E. & Viganò, F. (undated)** FRA, Thematic Study on Child Trafficking Italy. Available at: <http://fra.europa.eu/fraWebsite/attachments/Child-trafficking-09-country-it.pdf> [Accessed June 5, 2012].

**COE (2005)** Explanatory Report to the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings -CETS No. 197- [online]. Available at: <http://conventions.coe.int/treaty/en/reports/html/197.htm> [Accessed November 1, 2011].

**Coster van Voorhout, J., E.,B. (2007)** Human Trafficking for Labor Exploitation: Interpreting the Crime, Utrecht Law Review [pdf]: Volume3:2 Available through SSRN [Accessed October 27, 2011].

**Council of the European Union (2009)** Towards an external multidisciplinary approach to prevention of trafficking in human beings, prosecution of traffickers and protection of victims? [pdf] Available at: [http://www.eutrio.be/files/bveu/media/source1854/documents/Background\\_Anti-Trafficking\\_Day.pdf](http://www.eutrio.be/files/bveu/media/source1854/documents/Background_Anti-Trafficking_Day.pdf) [Accessed November 4, 2011].

**D'angelo, G.V.,Orfano, I. (2005)** The co-operation of law enforcement agencies and NGOs in the prevention of and support for victims of trafficking in persons for the purpose of

sexual exploitation. [pdf] Available at:

[http://www.google.nl/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=the%20italian%20system%20of%20assistance%20and%20integration%20of%20victims%20of%20trafficking%20in%20human%20beings%20by%20associazione%20on%20the%20road%20marco%20bufo%20and%20isabella%20orfa no&source=web&cd=4&ved=0CDMQFjAD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.mvcr.cz%2Fsoub or%2Fassociazione-on-the-road-italian-report-08.aspx&ei=5j7OTunDD8GSOp7uxJIP&usg=AFQjCNGfPqP1nvyJubVaso\\_T4c1ybl\\_OOA &sig2=FZIHkff9YIau4TtTCDbG7Q&cad=rja](http://www.google.nl/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=the%20italian%20system%20of%20assistance%20and%20integration%20of%20victims%20of%20trafficking%20in%20human%20beings%20by%20associazione%20on%20the%20road%20marco%20bufo%20and%20isabella%20orfa no&source=web&cd=4&ved=0CDMQFjAD&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.mvcr.cz%2Fsoub or%2Fassociazione-on-the-road-italian-report-08.aspx&ei=5j7OTunDD8GSOp7uxJIP&usg=AFQjCNGfPqP1nvyJubVaso_T4c1ybl_OOA &sig2=FZIHkff9YIau4TtTCDbG7Q&cad=rja) [Accessed November 1, 2011].

**David, F. & Australian Institute of Criminology (2007)** Law enforcement responses to trafficking in persons : challenges and emerging good practice, Canberra, ACT: Australian Institute of Criminology.

**Debabrata, R. (2007)** Anti Human Trafficking Interventions: Role of Law Enforcement.

Available at:

[file:///H:/bibliografia%20tesi/BIBLIOGRAFIA%20CAP%202/womensday08\\_4th\\_law.html](file:///H:/bibliografia%20tesi/BIBLIOGRAFIA%20CAP%202/womensday08_4th_law.html)  
[Accessed June 29, 2012].

**Department of Information Society and Action against Crime Directorate of**

**Cooperation Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs (2010)** The Dutch

approach to policing trafficking in human beings in the international context [pdf] The

Netherlands: Council of Europe, Available at:

[http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/cooperation/economiccrime/trafficking/Projects/THB%20Azerbaijan/REPORT\\_MAAS.pdf](http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/cooperation/economiccrime/trafficking/Projects/THB%20Azerbaijan/REPORT_MAAS.pdf) [Accessed at November 8, 2011].

**Department of States (2012)** Trafficking in Persons Report. Available at:  
<http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2012/index.htm> [Accessed May 4, 2012].

**Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2004)** Dutch Policy on Prostitution [pdf] The Netherlands Available at: [www.minbuza.nl/english](http://www.minbuza.nl/english) [Accessed November 9, 2011].

**Duyne, P. (2011)** Flesh and money : trafficking in human beings, Nijmegen The Netherlands: Wolf Legal Publishers.

**European Parliament** resolution 2010/B7-0029/EP of 10<sup>th</sup> of February 2010 on preventing trafficking in human beings.

**European Union (2011)** National general information: Italy.[online] Available at:  
<http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/showNIPsection.action?sectionId=6888c58a-3517-49fd-903c-c18984028f48> [Accessed November 10, 2011].

**European Union (2011)** National general information: The Netherlands. [online] Available at: <http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/showNIPsection.action;jsessionid=5LV0NnjKZhj8wyyqGTMvTpPLp461RzgZt1CdP3LJn3pV37nSthJG!855818409?sectionId=c295cd9a-f47e-4ccd-8601-3c453ed13965> [Accessed November 10, 2011].

**Flick, U., Kardorff, E. von & Steinke, I. (2004)** A companion to qualitative research, London [u.a.]: SAGE.

**Freed Taylor, M. (1994)** Ethical considerations in European cross-national research.

International Social Science Journal, no. 142, 1994, pages 523-532.

**Gallagher A. (2001)** Human Rights and the New UN Protocols on Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling. The Johns Hopkins University Press [pdf]: Available through SSRN [Accessed October 27, 2011].

**German Federation-State Working Group on Trafficking in Women (2007)** Cooperation concept for counselling services and the police concerning the protection of witnessing victims of traffic in human beings for the purpose of sexual exploitation, Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth.

**Gomm, R. (2008)** Social Research Methodology: A Critical Introduction, Second Edition 2. Aufl., Palgrave Macmillan.

**Hart, C. (1998)** Doing a literature review. Releasing the social science Imagination, London: Sage Publications.

**Harvey, C. & Barnidge Jr, R.P. (2007)** Human rights, free movement, and the right to leave in international law. International Journal of Refugee Law, 19(1), pagg.1–21.

**Heather J. et al. (2001)** Needs Assesment for Service Providers and Trafficking Victims. Available at: <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/202469.pdf> [Accessed July 2, 2012].

**Holmes, P. (2002)** Law Enforcement Co-operation with Non- Governmental Organisations, with reference to the Protection of Victims and Victims as Witnesses. Available at:  
<http://www.belgium.iom.int/STOPConference/Conference%20Papers/07.%20Holmes%20-%20Law%20Enforcement%20Cooperation.pdf> [Accessed July 1, 2012].

**Homan, R. (1991)** The Ethics of Social Research. London: Longman.

**HSRC Human Science Research Council (2010)** Tsireledzani: understanding the dimensions of human trafficking in Southern Africa. Available at:  
<http://www.hsrc.ac.za/Document-3562.phtml> [Accessed June 25, 2012].

**IACP (2006)** The Crime of Human Trafficking A Law Enforcement Guide to Identification and Investigation. Available at:  
<http://www.vaw.umn.edu/documents/completehtguide/completehtguide.pdf> [Accessed July 22, 2012].

**IOM (2006)** Rehabilitation of the Victims of Child Trafficking: A Multidisciplinary Approach. [pdf] Available at:  
[http://www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/20070626\\_124732\\_ilocpcr06\\_rehab\\_of\\_th\\_victims\\_octama.pdf](http://www.humantrafficking.org/uploads/publications/20070626_124732_ilocpcr06_rehab_of_th_victims_octama.pdf) [Accessed November 17, 2011].

**IOM (2009)** Guiding principles on memoranda of understanding between key stakeholders and law enforcement agencies on counter-trafficking cooperation a handbook for policy-makers and practitioners, Geneva [u.a.]: Internat. Organization for Migration [u.a.].



Available at: [http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/GIFT\\_IOM\\_Guiding\\_Principles\\_for\\_Stakeholders\\_and\\_Law\\_Enforcement\\_EGI\\_2009.pdf](http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/GIFT_IOM_Guiding_Principles_for_Stakeholders_and_Law_Enforcement_EGI_2009.pdf) [Accessed July 3, 2012].

**La Strada International (2012)** La Strada International first reaction to the EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings 2012–2016. Available at: <http://lastradainternational.org/lisidocs/LSI%20Statement%20on%20the%20EU%20Strategy.pdf> [Accessed July 10, 2012].

**Limoncelli, S.A. (2010)** The politics of trafficking : the first international movement to combat the sexual exploitation of women, Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press.

**Locher, B. (2007)** Trafficking in women in the European Union : norms, advocacy-networks and policy-change. Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften.

**Jorge-Birol A., P. (2008)** Empowering Victims of Human Trafficking: the Role of Support, Assistance and Protection Policies. [pdf] Available at: [http://www.etc-graz.at/cms/fileadmin/user\\_upload/humsec/Journal/Pedra.pdf](http://www.etc-graz.at/cms/fileadmin/user_upload/humsec/Journal/Pedra.pdf) [Accessed November 14, 2011].

**Mandal, S. (2009)** Trafficking in Women and Children: A Socio-Legal Challenge. [pdf]. Vol. 6:1-2, The University of Burdwan Available at: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=1701925](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1701925) [Accessed October 27, 2011].

**Marengo F. & Vaz Cabral, G. (2003)** Assisting Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings. Available at: [http://www.freedomunday.org/downloads/Guide\\_DAPHNE\\_ENG.pdf](http://www.freedomunday.org/downloads/Guide_DAPHNE_ENG.pdf) [Accessed July 8, 2012].

**May, T. (1997)** Social Research: Issues, Methods and Process 2. Aufl., Open University Press.

**May, T. (2011)** Social research : issues, methods and process 4th ed., Maidenhead Berkshire: Open University Press.

**Ministry of Justice Sweden & IOM (2010)** Towards Global EU-action Against Trafficking in Human Beings. Available at: [http://www.iomvienna.at/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=203:towards-global-eu action against-thb&catid=101:menschenhandel&Itemid=116&lang=en](http://www.iomvienna.at/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=203:towards-global-eu-action-against-thb&catid=101:menschenhandel&Itemid=116&lang=en). [Accessed May 22, 2012].

**Nair, P.,M. (2011)** Multidisciplinary and Multistakeholder Approach In Anti Human Trafficking, World Justice Forum III. Available at: <http://www.wjp-forum.org/2011/blog/multidisciplinary-and-multistakeholder-approach-anti-human-trafficking-1> [Accessed November 1, 2011].

**Ngozi Ezeilo, J. (2009)** Report submitted by the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children. Available at:

[http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/topic,4565c22535,4565c25f42b,49b52f9e2,0,UNHRC,THE\\_MREPORT,.html](http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/topic,4565c22535,4565c25f42b,49b52f9e2,0,UNHRC,THE_MREPORT,.html) [Accessed June 20, 2012].

**Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings (2008)** Efforts to combat trafficking in human beings in the OSCE area : co-ordination and reporting mechanisms; presented at the permanent council meeting, 13 November 2008, Vienna: OSCE. Available at <http://www.osce.org/cthb/36159?download=true> [Accessed July 16, 2012].

**ONT (2012)** Osservatorio Nazionale Tratta. [online] Available at: <http://www.osservatorionazionaletratta.it/index.php> [Accessed November 14, 2011].

**OSCE (2004)** National Referral Mechanisms Joining Efforts to Protect the Rights of Trafficked Persons A Practical Handbook. Available at: <http://www.osce.org/node/13967> [Accessed June 20, 2012].

**OSCE (2012)** Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe [online] Available at: <http://www.osce.org/cthb/documents> [Accessed October 26, 2011].

**Peiro, M., Zanette, M., Keating, T., and Holmes, P. (2008)** Networking to fight human trafficking in Europe. [pdf] Brussels: International Organization for Migration. Available at: <http://www.iom.int/france/pdf/NetworkingFightHumanTrafficking.pdf> [Accessed 18 October 2011].

**Pretty Women (undated)** Werkstukpagina over lover boys, [working paper]. Available at: <<http://www.stichtingstade.nl/plaatjes/user/File/werkstuk%20pw/090702-werkstukpag-overloverboys.pdf>> [Accessed April 23, 2012].

**Ragin, C. (1994)** Constructing Social Research: The Unity and Diversity of Method. London: Pine Forge Press.

**Rahman, M.A. (2011)** Human Trafficking in the era of Globalization: The case of Trafficking in the Global Market Economy. *Transcience: a Journal of Global Studies*, 2. Available at: [http://www2.hu-berlin.de/transcience/Vol2\\_Issue1\\_2011\\_54\\_71\\_Glossary.pdf](http://www2.hu-berlin.de/transcience/Vol2_Issue1_2011_54_71_Glossary.pdf) [Accessed July 8, 2012].

**Rescue & Restore (2011)** Services Available to Victims of Human Trafficking. A source guide for Social Service Providers. Available at: <http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/traffickingservices.pdf> [Accessed July 4, 2012].

**Richter, W.L. & Richter, L.K. (2007)** Human Trafficking, Globalization, and Ethics, Available at: <http://www.aspaonline.org/ethicscommunity/documents/Human%20Trafficking,%20Globalization%20and%20Ethics.pdf> [Accessed July 8, 2012].

**Rijken, C. & Koster, D. (2008)** A Human Rights Based Approach to Trafficking in Human Beings in Theory and Practice.[pdf] Available at:

[http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=1135108](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1135108) [Accessed November 13, 2011].

**Rubin, H.J. & Rubin, I. (2005)** Qualitative interviewing : the art of hearing data, Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage Publications.

**Scarpa, S. (2008)** Trafficking in human beings : modern slavery, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

**Share Hope International (undated)** The Netherlands: Trade and Tolerance Lead to Trafficking, [pdf], Available at: <  
[http://www.sharedhope.org/Portals/0/Documents/demand\\_netherlands.pdf](http://www.sharedhope.org/Portals/0/Documents/demand_netherlands.pdf)> [Accessed 23, April 2012].

**Schlaeger, S. (2010)** ICMPD In The fourth EU Anti-Trafficking Days: Paving the way towards an integrated and multidisciplinary approach.[pdf] Available at:  
[http://www.dialogueafricaandmd.net/newsletter/en/The\\_fourth\\_EU\\_anti\\_trafficking\\_days\\_Sarah\\_Schlaeger.pdf](http://www.dialogueafricaandmd.net/newsletter/en/The_fourth_EU_anti_trafficking_days_Sarah_Schlaeger.pdf). [Accessed October 20, 2011].

**SOCA (2012)** Serious Organized Crime Agency [online] Available at:  
<http://www.soca.gov.uk/> [Accessed May 16, 2012].

**Social Development Notes Conflicts, Crime and Violence (2009)** Human Trafficking: A Brief Overview. Available at:

[http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTSOCIALDEVELOPMENT/Resources/244362-1239390842422/6012763-1239905793229/Human\\_Trafficking.pdf](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTSOCIALDEVELOPMENT/Resources/244362-1239390842422/6012763-1239905793229/Human_Trafficking.pdf) [Accessed June 18, 2012].

**The Global Alliance against Traffic in Women, La Strada International (2009)** NGO Priority for 2009 EU Anti-Trafficking day: focus on Human Trafficking. In A comprehensive Multidisciplinary Approach towards Trafficking in Human Beings: Active cooperation among countries of origin, transit and destination. [doc.] [Accessed 21 October 2011].

**Touzenis, K. (2010)** Trafficking in human beings human rights and transnational criminal law, developments in law and practices. Available at:  
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0018/001883/188397e.pdf> [Accessed July 8, 2012].

**TRANSCRIME & Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri Dipartimento delle Pari Opportunità (2010)** Rapporto di ricerca Attività 2.a – Repertorio normativo (internazionale, nazionale, regionale e locale) completo ed aggiornato Prodotto 2.a1. Available at:  
[http://www.osservatorionazionaletratta.it/files/generics/prodotto\\_2.a1.pdf](http://www.osservatorionazionaletratta.it/files/generics/prodotto_2.a1.pdf) [Accessed July 1, 2012].

**UN (2000)** Protocol Against The Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime. Available at:

[http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\\_documents\\_2/convention\\_smug\\_eng.pdf](http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_smug_eng.pdf) [Accessed April 12, 2012].

**UN (2000)** Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights,[pdf] Palermo 15-November 2000, New York: United Nations.

**UN (2004)** United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols thereto. Available at:

<http://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf> [Accessed June 30, 2012].

**UN. GIFT (2008)** An introduction to human trafficking: vulnerability, impact and action [pdf] Vienna: UNODC, Available at: [http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/An\\_Introduction\\_to\\_Human\\_Trafficking\\_-\\_Background\\_Paper.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/An_Introduction_to_Human_Trafficking_-_Background_Paper.pdf) [Accessed 4 October 2011].

**UN.GIFT (2009)** Global report of trafficking in persons [pdf] Available at: [http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Global\\_Report\\_on\\_TIP.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Global_Report_on_TIP.pdf) [Accessed 13 October 2011].

**UN.GIFT (2010)** Human Trafficking and Business: Good practices to prevent and combat human trafficking. Available at: [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms\\_142722.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_142722.pdf) [Accessed July 4, 2012].

**UN. GIFT (n.b.)** Human trafficking: the facts. [online] UN. GIFT. Available at:  
[http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues\\_doc/labour/Forced\\_labour/HUMAN\\_TRAFFICKING\\_-\\_THE\\_FACTS\\_-\\_final.pdf](http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues_doc/labour/Forced_labour/HUMAN_TRAFFICKING_-_THE_FACTS_-_final.pdf) [Accessed July 11, 2012].

**UN.GIFT & OIM (2009)** Guiding principles on memoranda of understanding between key stakeholders and law enforcement agencies on counter trafficking cooperation. Available at:  
[http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/GIFT\\_IOM\\_Guiding\\_Principles\\_for\\_Stakeholders\\_and\\_Law\\_Enforcement\\_EGI\\_2009.pdf](http://www.ungift.org/doc/knowledgehub/resource-centre/GIFT_IOM_Guiding_Principles_for_Stakeholders_and_Law_Enforcement_EGI_2009.pdf) [Accessed June 15, 2012].

**UNGIFT & UNODC (2008)** An Introduction to Human Trafficking: Vulnerability, Impact and Action. Available at:  
[http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/knowledge/background\\_paper.pdf](http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/knowledge/background_paper.pdf) [Accessed July 1, 2012].

**UN.GIFT & UNODC (2010)** First Aid Kit for Use by Law Enforcement First Responders in Addressing Human Trafficking. Available at: [http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/First-Aid-Kit/First\\_Aid\\_Kit\\_-\\_Booklet\\_eng.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/First-Aid-Kit/First_Aid_Kit_-_Booklet_eng.pdf) [Accessed June 7, 2012].

**UNODC (2009)** Combating Trafficking in persons. A hand book for Parliamentarians. s.l.: United Nations.



**UNODC (2009)** Trafficking in Persons; Analysis on Europe. Available at:  
<http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/entity.action?id=222e944b-b325-49e0-ac10-53b173b907d1> [Accessed June 1, 2012].

**UNODC (2012)** Strategy on Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling. Available at:  
[http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/UNODC\\_Strategy\\_on\\_Human\\_Trafficking\\_and\\_Migrant\\_Smuggling.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/UNODC_Strategy_on_Human_Trafficking_and_Migrant_Smuggling.pdf)  
[Accessed July 1, 2012].

**Van den Borne, A. & O' Briain, M. (2004)** Trafficking in children for sexual purposes: Updated country report-The Netherlands, [pdf], Available at:  
<<http://www.ecpat.nl/images/13/383.pdf>>, [Accessed 23, April 2012].

**Van Impe, K. (2000)** People for sale: The need for a multidisciplinary approach towards human trafficking. *International Migration*, 38(3), pagg.113–191.

**Ventralla, M. (2007)** Protecting Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings in the UK: The Italian «Rimini Method» that could Influence the British approach. [pdf] Available at:  
[http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=996156](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=996156) [Accessed November 12, 2011].

**Verma, S. (2010)** An Analysis of Policies to Combat Human Trafficking, working paper, Available at: [http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=1919264](http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1919264) [Accessed October 27, 2011].

**WHO, Zimmerman, C. et al. (2003)** Ethical and safety recommendations for interviewing trafficked women, United Kingdom: WHO.

**Wisker, G. (2008)** The postgraduate research handbook : succeed with your MA, MPhil, EdD and PhD. 2nd ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

**Zechmeister, E.B. & Posavac, E.J. (2003)** Data analysis and interpretation in the behavioral sciences,  
Australia; Belmont, CA: Thomson/Wadsworth.

## ANNEX

### Annex 1

Interview guide

INTRODUCING MY SELF

GENERAL/EASY QUESTIONS IN ORDER TO CREATE EMPATHY AND LESS FORMAL ATMOSPHERE

- 1- How long have you been working for this service?
- 2- How does it come that you are working for this service/department?
- 3- What have you done before you worked in this social service/in this police department?

DEVELOPMENT OF THE CENTRAL QUESTIONS

- 4- Could you please explain about your professional mandatory?
  - What are you supposed to do when you come across a case of human trafficking, in your profession?
- 5- How much cooperation should be included in relation to your professional mandatory?
- 6- What does cooperation mean for you?
- 7- Are there any interdisciplinary regular trainings? If yes...
  - How often?
  - How are they structured? Who are the trainers?
  - Would you define them as effective?
  - Do you think that the information exchange goes fluently?

- Do you think it represents the right platform where to develop “best practice models” that could be recommended to decision makers, in order to enhance multidisciplinary approaches?
  - Could you please explain which are the weaknesses and the strengths concerning these training?
- 8- Are there any cooperation protocols\agreements? If yes...
- When they were established?
  - Are they National or Local agreements?
  - What do you think about them? Are there any gaps, which are not covered? If yes...could you please explain a little bit more about it....
  - What are the aspects that should be improved?
  - Which are the aspects you would define as being “good practice” in regard to these agreements?
  - Which are the aspects you would define as being an obstacle in daily work?
  - Is the effectiveness of these agreements evaluated somehow? I mean...are they regularly assessed?
- 9- In extreme cases, when for example a child or a women has to be rescued as fast as possible, do you think information exchange is rapid enough, valid, are there any difficulties in understanding each other among the two professions?
- 10- Do you think there is a cooperative approach from both sides?
- 11- During the evaluation of the case, do you think, there is a concrete cooperation?
- 12- In which phase, of the whole victim’s protection procedure, do you think cooperation is the most effective and the most needed? Identification, assistance, re-integration into society, or repatriation in the country of origin?

- 13- Do you think the Law enforcement officers/social workers contribute in establishing a trustful relationship between the professions? If yes...
- Would you say/state that there is a mutual understanding and trust?
  - What represents the main contribution?
  - Would you say that there is transparency regarding the respective operating modes?
- 14- Do you think there is a common understanding of the objectives between the two professions?
- 15- What should the State do in order to implement cooperation? On the basis of your experience, do you have any particular suggestion?
- 16- What corresponds, in relation to your experience, to good practice?
- Can you please report an example of a case, where you thought the cooperation was valuable.
- 17- What correspond, in relation to your experience, to bad practice?
- Can you please report an example of a case, where you thought cooperation was not managed as it should.
  - Why do you think it is so difficult to cooperate with the police / social service?
- 18- Which, do you think, are the main conflicts or potential conflicts between both professions?
- 19- Do you think there are any particular ethical issues which arise, while dealing with human trafficking cases, among the two professions?
- Can you please report a practical example where there was an ethical dilemma?

- Do we have a clear distinction between care and control, or the two professions, sometimes, overlap? I mean...everybody has its own role which does not interfere with the other...

20- Would you say that there is awareness regarding the identification and recognition of a common goal? (Fighting against Human Trafficking)

21- Have you any proposal(s) how the cooperation can or should be improved?

22- Since you have been working for this service/this department, do you think it has been any improvement concerning cooperation?

- Which?

## CLOSING THE INTERVIEW

## **Annex 2**

According to the Palermo Protocol in article 2 the purpose is: to prevent and combat trafficking in persons, to protect and assist the victims, and to promote cooperation in order to meet these goals (Palermo Protocol, 2000).

### *Article 2 Part (C)*

#### *Part I General Provisions*

*( c ) To promote cooperation among States Parties in order to meet those objectives.*

More specifically, according to part III Prevention, cooperation and other measures of the Palermo protocol, some parts are explicitly mentioning the need to work through a cooperative approach in order to tackle the phenomenon.

As the following quotes of Article 9, parts 1, 3, 4, and 5 and Article 10, parts 1, 2, and 3 show:

### *Article 9*

#### *Prevention of trafficking in persons*

*1. States Parties shall establish comprehensive policies, programmes and other measures:*

*( a ) To prevent and combat trafficking in persons; and*

*( b ) To protect victims of trafficking in persons, especially women and children, from revictimization.*

*3. Policies, programmes and other measures established in accordance with this article shall, as appropriate, include cooperation with non-governmental organizations, other relevant organizations and other elements of civil society.*

*4. States Parties shall take or strengthen measures, including through bilateral or multilateral cooperation, to alleviate the factors that make persons, especially women and children, vulnerable to trafficking, such as poverty, underdevelopment and lack of equal opportunity.*

*5. States Parties shall adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures, including through bilateral and multilateral cooperation, to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking.<sup>8</sup>*

#### *Article 10*

##### *Information exchange and training*

*1. Law enforcement, immigration or other relevant authorities of States Parties shall, as appropriate, cooperate with one another by exchanging information, in accordance with their domestic law, to enable them to determine:*

---

<sup>8</sup> Article 9 part 1,3,4 and 5 (Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, 2000).



*( a ) Whether individuals crossing or attempting to cross an international border with travel documents belonging to other persons or without travel documents are perpetrators or victims of trafficking in persons;*

*( b ) The types of travel document that individuals have used or attempted to use to cross an international border for the purpose of trafficking in persons; and*

*( c ) The means and methods used by organized criminal groups for the purpose of trafficking in persons, including the recruitment and transportation of victims, routes and links between and among individuals and groups engaged in such trafficking, and possible measures for detecting them.*

*2. States Parties shall provide or strengthen training for law enforcement, immigration and other relevant officials in the prevention of trafficking in persons. The training should focus on methods used in preventing such trafficking, prosecuting the traffickers and protecting the rights of the victims, including protecting the victims from the traffickers. The training should also take into account the need to consider human rights and child- and gender-sensitive issues and it should encourage cooperation with non-governmental organizations, other relevant organizations and other elements of civil society.*

*3. A State Party that receives information shall comply with any request by the State Party that transmitted the information that places restrictions on its use.<sup>9</sup>*

---

<sup>9</sup> Article 10 part 1,2 and 3 (Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children, 2000).

So, as reported above, in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons Especially Women and Children the importance of cooperation is emphasized, mainly seen as a means to achieve the overall objectives (Palermo Protocol, 2000).